AS THE CRITICS LIKE IT

As a sequel to the Brussels Referendum (featured in the previous issue of SIGHT AND SOUND), in which about 100 film directors were asked to vote for what they considered the Ten Best Films of all time, we decided to ask the critics the same question. 85 critics, from Britain, France, the United States, Italy, Germany, Denmark, Sweden, Belgium, Czechoslovakia, Yugoslavia, were asked, and 63 responded; the co-operation is much appreciated.

Most critics were unanimous in finding the question unfair. "What an awful idea," "What a thing to ask," "I feel simply broken," "disturbing," "impossible," "barbarous," "silly" and "lousy" were among the comments passed. One pointed out that he had seen about 3,200 films, another that he had seen exactly 5,777. As with the Brussels Referendum letter, our request was for personal references—"the films that have impressed you most personally"—and many critics were quick and right to answer that the films one thought best (in the history of the cinema, etc.), were not necessarily the films one liked best. Other reservations were that memory plays tricks, and that 10 was an unreasonable and arbitrary number. Why not 50? asked one contributor (sending in 15 choices). Why not 23? suggested another.

Space, unfortunately, does not permit us to include all these interesting, apt and sometimes desperate reservations, nor to publish every individual list. In the space available we have tried to print as representative a selection as possible, bearing in mind nationality, types of critic (dailies, weekly, magazine, occasional, writer of books, etc.), and the interest of listing as many different films as possible. We apologise for the omissions.

As can be seen, the top four choices of the critics agree with those of the directors, though in a different order. Bicycle Thieves won easily with 23 out of a possible 63 votes, the two Chaplins films tied with 19 each, and Potemkin followed with 16. After that the number dropped to 12, and the films followed each other very closely, four tying for the last place.

Films in the critics' and not the directors' best ten are Louisiana Story, Le Jeu de L'Out, La Passion de Jeanne d'Arc, Intolerance and La Règle du Jeu. Apart from these, The Grapes of Wrath, The Childhood of Maxim Gorki, Earth, Citizen Kane, Monsieur Verdoux, Que Viva Mexico, Zéro de Conduite and Les Dames du Bois de Boulogne are placed high in the runners-up by critics, and not by directors. Some of the directors' strongest personal choices, by contrast—Hallelujah!, Foolish Wives, Storm over Asia, Le Diable au Corps, Dreigroschenoper—receive considerably fewer votes in this referendum.

Most appropriate last word, perhaps, from a distracted critic: "Goodness, how hard it was to whistle down!"

THE TEN BEST FILMS

1. Bicycle Thieves (de Sica, 1949) 25
2. City Lights (Chaplin, 1930) 19
3. The Gold Rush (Chaplin, 1925) 16
4. Potemkin (Eisenstein, 1925) 16
5. Louisiana Story (Frakhter, 1947) 12
6. Intolerance (Griffith, 1916) 11
7. Greed (von Stroheim, 1924) 11
8. Le Monde de L'Ive (Carne, 1939) 8
9. Le Million (Clair, 1930) 7
10. La Règle du Jeu (Renier, 1939) 10

MAIN RUNNERS-UP

1. Citizen Kane (Wehles, 1941) 9
2. La Grande Illusion (Renier, 1923) 9
3. Gries of Wrath (Ford, 1940) 8
4. Childhood of Maxim Gorki (Donskoi, 1938) 8
5. Monsieur Verdoux (Chaplin, 1932) 7
6. Que Viva Mexico (Eisstein, 1931) 7
7. Zéro de Conduite (Vigo, 1933) 6
8. Broken Blossoms (Griffith, 1919) 6
9. Les Dames du Bois de Boulogne (Breno, 1945) 6
10. Hallelujah! (Vido, 1929) 6

SOME PERSONAL CHOICES

LINDSAY ANDERSON (Britain)
1. Earth 2. They Were Expenderable (Ford)
Antoine et Antoinette (Becker) 11. Force of Evil (Polansky)

". . . A selection of Desert Island films, with no pretence at completeness. . . . I have also cheated outrageously: but then isn't the question itself a bit of a cheat?"

GUIDO ARISTARCO (Italy)

(Alphabetical order)

HOLLEU ARMHEIM (U.S.A.)

ALEXANDRE ASTRUC (France)

HUBERH BARRY (U.S.A.)

". . . A hetchpotch of personal bias . . . out of confusion and the experience of a lifetime"

ANDRE BAZIN (France)

"A series of personal awards, on critical reflection, rather than of original memories and impacts. . . ."

JOSH BILLSING (Britain)
1. All Quiet on the Western Front 2. Four Horsemen of the Apocalypse (Milestone) 3. In Which We Serve (Coward) 4. Mutiny on the Bounty (Lloyd) 5. Ninotchka (Lubitsch) 6. One Way Passage (Garnett) 7. Pygmalion (Asquith) 8. Best Years of our Lives (Wyler) 9. Snow White (Disney) 10. Way Down East (Griffith)

(Alphabetical order)
### FRANCIS DOLEN (Belgium)
1. Cabinet of Dr. Caligari (Wiene)  2. The Phantom Carriage
3. Gold Rush  4. Nanook of the North (Flaherty)  5. Napoleon (Gance)
6. Erotikon (Machaty)  7. L’Hippocampe (Painlevé)

### FREDERICK LOCKHART (Britain)
1. Jeanne d’Arc  2. Birth of a Nation
3. Le Million  4. Louisiana Story
5. Stagecoach  6. Ninotchka
7. Top Hat (Astaire-Rogers)  8. The Third Man (Reed)
9. Fortrebbles (Rouquier)  10. La Règle du Jeu

### OTTO BREUSDORFF (Denmark)
1. To the Sea (Kjær)  2. Broken Blossoms
5. Mutter Krausen’s Fährt ins Glück (Jutza)  6. Queen Christina (Mamoulian)
7. Tin Tin (Elias)  8. Broken Blossoms
9. Stagecoach

### CONNERY CHAPPELL (Britain)
1. New Year’s Eve (Lupino)  2. Italian Straw Hat (Clair)
3. Joyless Street (Pastr)  4. The General Line (Eisenstein)
5. Berlin (Ruttmann)  6. City Lights
7. Finis Terra (Epstein)  8. Variety (Dupont)

### GEORGES CHARENSOL (France)
1. Gold Rush  2. Louisiana Story
3. Jeanne d’Arc  4. Le Million
7. Thy Soul Shall Bear Witness  8. Broken Blossoms (Seastrom)
8. Mother

### LOUIS ESZTERGOM (France)
1. Man of Aran  2. Bicycle Thieves
3. City Lights  4. Le Million
5. The Lost Petrol (Ford)  6. Gran Pastor (Keighley)
7. Brief Encounter  8. All About Eve (Mankiewicz)
9. Blue Express (Trauberg)  10. The Heiress (Wyler)

### PAUL DEHN (Britain)
1. Metropolis (Lang)  2. Testament of Dr. Mabuse (Lang)
5. Citizen Kane  5. Odd Man Out (Hitchcock)
6. Open City (Rossellini)  7. Odd Man Out (Reed)
8. Henry V  8. Orphée (Cocteau)
9. On the Town (Kelly-Denon)

### CATHERINE DE LA ROCHE (Britain)
1. City Lights  2. Childhood of Maxim Gorki
5. Casque d’Or (Bockar)  6. Nothing Sacred (Wellman)
7. Miss Julie (Soborg)  7. Hail the Conquering Hero (Sturges)
8. On the Town (Kelly-Denon)

### CAMPBELL DIXON (Britain)
1. Sous les Toits de Paris  2. Les Enfants du Paradis
3. All Quiet on the Western Front  3. La Terra Tirma (Visconti)
7. Childhood of Maxim Gorki  7. Monsieur Verdoux
8. Résistance

### JACQUES DONIOU-VALCHER (France)
1. Que Viva Mexico  2. Dames du Bois de Boulogne
3. Intolerance  4. La Terra Tirma (Visconti)
5. Sunrise  5. Magnificent Ambersons
7. River (Renoir)  7. Les Dernières Vacances (Renhardt)
8. (not in order of preference)

### LO DUC (Italy-France)
1. Jeanne d’Arc  2. Man of Aran
3. La Grande Illusion  4. Gold Rush
5. Bicycle Thieves  6. Greed
9. Henry V  10. Citizen Kane

### LOTTE H. ELISBER (France)
1. Monseur Verdoux  2. Gold Rush
3. Birth of a Nation  4. Petemkin
5. Greed  6. L’Age d’Or
7. Zéro de Conduite  8. Earth
9. Tabu  10. Louisiana Story

### RICHARD GRIFFITH (U.S.A.)
1. Nanook of the North  2. Intolerance
3. Meane (Flaherty)  4. Warning Shadows (Robison)
5. Arsenal  5. So This Is Paris (Lubitsch)
7. Hallelujah (Vidor)  8. The Wedding March

### JEPHSON HARMAN (Britain)
1. Gold Rush  2. City Lights
3. Intolerance  4. Best Years of Our Lives
5. Gone With the Wind (Fleming)  6. Man of Aran
7. Sous les Toits de Paris  8. Brief Encounter

### CURTIS HARRINGTON (U.S.A.)
1. Greed  2. Zéro de Conduite
3. La Règle du Jeu  4. The Devil is a Woman (Sternberg)
5. Vampyr (Dreyer)  6. L’Age d’Or
7. Dura Lex (Kuleshov)  7. A Nous la Liberté!
8. Never Give a Sucker an Even Break (W. C. Fields)  8. Orphée
9. Dames du Bois de Boulogne  9. Casque d’Or
10. (Not in order of preference)

### PHILIP HOPE-WALLACE (Britain)
1. End of St. Petersburg  2. Jeanne d’Arc
3. Student of Prague (Galeen)  3. Love of Jeanne Ney (Pabst)
4. La Bête Humaine (Renoir)  5. The General (Keaton)
6. Grapes of Wrath  6. Orphée
7. Los Olvidados  7. Citizen Kane
8. Casque d’Or

### PENEOLE HOUSTON (Britain)
1. Aztlan  2. Citizen Kane
3. City Lights  3. Dames du Bois de Boulogne
4. Earth  4. Dames du Bois de Boulogne
5. Greed  5. Dames du Bois de Boulogne
6. Grapes of Wrath  6. Dames du Bois de Boulogne
7. October  7. Dames du Bois de Boulogne
8. La Règle du Jeu  8. Dames du Bois de Boulogne
9. A Nous la Liberté!
10. (Alphabetical order)

### THEODORE HUFF (U.S.A.)
1. Intolerance  2. Broken Blossoms
2. Woy Down East  3. Mark of Zorro (Fairbanks)
4. Student of Prague (Galeen)  5. Der Letzte Mann (von Sternberg)
5. City Lights  6. The General (Keaton)
6. The Informer (Ford)  7. Zéro de Conduite
7. Day of Wrath (Dreyer)  8. Orphée
8. L’Age d’Or
9. Los Olvidados
10. (Alphabetical order)

### SIROL HUGH JONES (Britain)
1. La Règle du Jeu  2. Citizen Kane
2. Letter from an Unknown Woman (Ophuls)
3. Le Jour se Lève  4. Letter from an Unknown Woman (Ophuls)
5. Orpheée  5. The Ancient Law (Dupont)
7. City Lights  7. Miracolo a Milano
8. Los Olvidados
9. Los Olvidados
10. (Alphabetical order)

### B. IDESTAM-ALQUIST (Sweden)
1. Assassinat du Duc de Guise (Calmette)  2. Keystone farces (Chaplin)
2. Aune’s Treasure (Stiller)  3. The Covered Wagon (Cruze)
3. The Ancient Law (Dupont)  4. La Terra Tirma (Visconti)
4. October  5. Monsieur Verdoux
5. Henry V
6. Les Dernières Vacances (Renhardt)
7. October
8. Henry V
9. Henry V
10. Henry V
### SIEGFRIED KRACAUER (U.S.A.)
1. The Joyless Street
2. M (Lang)
3. La Chienne (Renoir)
4. Le Million
5. Lonesome (Fejos)
6. Potemkin
7. Poiso
8. Gold Rush
9. Louisiana Story
10. Los Olvidados

### GAVIN LAMBERT (Britain)
1. Greed
2. Earth
3. L’Âge d’Or
4. La Règle du Jeu
5. The Kid (Chaplin)
6. A Diary for Timothy (Jennings)
7. The Quiet Man (Ford)
8. Hallelujah!
9. Que Viva Mexico
10. Las Olvidadas

### HENRI LANGLOIS (France)
1. Chaplin’s 1916 films
2. Gold Rush
3. Intolerance
4. Birth of a Nation
5. Queen Kelly (Stroheim)
6. Potemkin
7. Que Viva Mexico
8. Monsieur Verdoux

### FRIEDRICH LEUT (Germany)
1. Gold Rush
2. Potemkin
3. City Lights
4. Le Jour se Lève
5. M
6. Louisiana Story
7. Meskarede (Forst)
8. The Blue Angel (Stroheim)
9. Miracolo a Milano
10. Jeux interdits (Clement)

### ROGER MANVEL (Britain)
1. Bicycle Thieves
2. Childhood of Maxim Gorki
3. City Lights
4. Fires Were Started
5. La Grande Illusion
6. Grapes of Wrath
7. Isole nella Laguna (Emmer)
8. Le Jour se Lève
9. Louisiana Story
10. Odd Man Out, On the Town, Oxbow Incident (Wellman), Song of Ceylon (Wright), Sous les Toits de Paris, Zero de Conduite

“I can only play the ‘choice’ game if I can break the ten rule... List in alphabetical order.”

### CLAUDE MAURRAC (France)
1. Birth of a Nation
2. Gold Rush
3. Que Viva Mexico
4. Malignant Ambersons
5. La Règle du Jeu
6. Esper (Malka"
7. Bicycle Thieves
8. The Fallen Idol (Reed)
9. Miss Julie
10. The River (Renoir)

### GENE MOSKOWITZ (U.S.A.)
1. Greed
2. City Lights
3. M
4. Grapes of Wrath
5. Le Jour se Lève
7. Miracolo a Milano
8. Louisiana Story
9. Bicycle Thieves
10. Childhood of Maxim Gorki

### ERBE NEERGAARD (Denmark)
1. Birth of a Nation
2. Mutual Films, Easy Street, The Care, The Pawnshop, The Immigrant (Chaplin)
3. The Phantom Carriage (Seastrand)
4. Feu Mathias Pascal L’Herbier
5. Jeanne d’Arc
6. Storm over Asia (Pudovkin)
7. Petroff Forest (Mayo)
8. Drôle de Drame (Carne)
9. Childhood of Maxim Gorki
10. The Little Foxes, Day of Wrath, Bicycle Thieves, Miracolo a Milano

### DIILS POWELL (Britain)
1. Easy Street
2. The General
3. Grapes of Wrath
4. Henry V
5. Intolerance
6. Louisiana Story
7. Le Millia
8. Les Olvidados
9. Olympiad Festival of Nations (Riefenstahl)
10. Orpheus

“I refuse to list in order of preference. Alphabets before honours.”

### JEAN QUEVIL (France)
1. The Pilgrim
2. Bicycle Thieves
3. The River (Renoir)
4. Louisiana Story
5. Que Viva Mexico
6. Guerrilla (Raoul"
7. A Propos de Nice (Vigo)
8. Joe de Vieville (Gross"
9. Dots (MacLaren)
10. Le Tanneller (Rouquier)

“...the Brussels referendum made fascinating nonsense... Since I thrive on nonsense, this is my list... a subjective, humble selection through which I pleasantly recall the lasting impression made upon me by works I like.”

### TERRY RAMSAYE (U.S.A.)
1. The Durbar (Urban: British)
2. Intolerance
3. Kinemacolour documentary
4. Cabinet of Dr. Caligari
5. Big Parade (Vidor)
6. All That Money Can Buy (Dietrich)
7. All About Eve

### ROGER REGENT (France)
1. Gold Rush
2. Broken Blossoms
3. Louisiana Story
4. Potemkin
5. Hallelujah!
6. Le Million
7. Quai des Brumes (Carné)
8. Dreyfus (Olivier)

### KAREL REISZ (Britain)
1. All Quiet on the Western Front
2. L’Albatross
3. City Lights
4. Earth
5. Le Jour se Lève
6. Belgian Proprietor (Bennings)
7. Mikrolo a Milano
8. The Palm Beach Story
9. The Wages of Fear (Sturges)
10. Wagonmaster (Ford)

### PAUL ROCHA (Britain)
1. Greed
2. Potemkin
3. Gold Rush
4. Italian Straw Hat
5. Turkish (Todt"
6. Earth
7. Kammerjäckel (Pabst)
8. L’Albatross
9. Open City
10. Bicycle Thieves

### MILTON SHULMAN (Britain)
1. Intolerance
2. City Lights
3. Bicycle Thieves
4. All Quiet on the Western Front
5. Brief Encounter
6. Nothing Sacred
7. Potemkin
8. Stagecoach
9. Night at the Opera
10. The Blue Angel (Max Bros)

### ERICH ULRICHSEN (Denmark)
1. Greed
2. Zéro de Conduite
3. Les Enfants du Paradis
4. Easy Street
5. Listen to Britain
6. Vampyr
7. Menschen am Sonntag
8. Horse Feathers (Max Bros)
9. The Ox-Bow Incident
10. C’est l’Aréne (MacLaren)

### MARIO VERDONE (Italy)
1. Potemkin
2. La Grande Illusion
3. Bicycle Thieves
4. Italian Straw Hat
5. Tabu
6. Louisiana Story
7. Arne’s Treasure
8. The Pilgrim
9. Les Enfants du Paradis
10. Hallelujah!

### WILLIAM WHITEHEAD (Britain)
1. Gold Rush
2. City Lights
3. Modern Times (Chaplin)
4. Shoulder Arms (Chaplin)
5. Great Dictator (Chaplin)
6. Easy Street
7. The Kid
8. One A.M.
9. Monsieur Verdoux

### RICHARD WINTHIN (Britain)
1. Childhood of Maxim Gorki
2. Zéro de Conduite
3. Bicycle Thieves
4. Italian Straw Hat
5. The Asphalt Jungle (Huston)
6. All That Money Can Buy (Dietrich)
7. Manschettenuniform (Sagan)
8. In the White Suit (Mackendrick)

### ARNHEIM WINTHIN (U.S.A.)
1. Farrebique
2. Stars Look Down (Reed)
3. Our Town (Wood)
4. Bicycle Thieves
5. Day of Wrath
6. Odd Man Out
7. Henry V
8. Man in the White Suit (Mackendrick)