A Lmost TEN YEARS AGO a referendum was organised from Brussels in which film directors were asked to nominate the ten best films in cinema history. Sight and Sound, following in Brussels' wake, has repeated the same exercise, which drew a response from over 200 critics. Both lists were duly published (the first and second respectively, in 1952 and 1954). Since then, they have been played again, during the Brussels Exhibition a few years ago. And now we have asked the critics to have another go, not because we think—or imagine they think—that anyone else’s list is necessarily better, or because the consensus of opinion reached by totting up the various choices involves any definitive judgment, but precisely because no judgments can be definitive. One doesn’t arrive at an objective review of the best films ever made (how could one?) but at an indication of how opinion is moving and what the cinema looks like in the perspective of 1962.

The cinema has been given a shake-up in the last few years: the New Wave in France; the advances in Italy; the West’s discovery of the Oriental cinemas; the new cinemas of Eastern Europe and Latin America, and so on. Every six months a new movement or school is discovered somewhere, and critical opinion fluctuates like a barometer in a storm. We thought it would be interesting to see whether taste had significantly changed in the last ten years, how far the ‘new cinema’ might be shaping out the established classics, and how much the rise of a post-war generation of critics, people to whom the silent cinema has none of the pull it still exerts on their elders, might have shifted the balance.

We sent out a questionnaire to over a hundred critics, in this country and overseas, made only one stipulation. We asked people to send us really personal selections, not to let themselves be influenced by academic orthodoxy into nominating films they might not have seen for twenty or thirty years and remembered as misty landmarks. We received 70 answers, the majority of them from this country, the United States and France, but also from Sweden, Denmark, Finland, Belgium, Italy, Spain, Poland and the Soviet Union. We’d like to thank everyone who responded, and also to apologise to those whose individual lists we have been unable to print because of pressure on space. We’re sorry, too, that there isn’t room to print more of the comments we’ve received. From Poland, a claim to a record number of titles seen—13,000; a number of agonised crises de cœur, from critics who could have had us a hundred titles with ease but jabbed desperately at ten; explanations of choices and forecasts of winners. "Every film critic’s favourite parlour game," said one of our contributors; "yes, it is difficult and impossible but we will try again," said another. We’ve tried, as on the previous occasion, to print individual lists which cover the widest range of titles and cross-section of opinion; and we’ve limited our invitation to working critics, with the few exceptions (Karel Reisz here, Curtis Harrington in the U.S.A.) of critics who have become film-makers since they took part in the same feature ten years ago.

VOTING BY DIRECTORS

Sergei Eisenstein 46
Charles Chaplin 44
Jean Renoir 35
Orson Welles 30
Michelangelo Antonioni 27
Vittorio De Sica 25
Alain Resnais 24
Jean Vigo 23
Kenji Mizoguchi 23
Erich von Stroheim 20
Luca Visconti 19

THE TOP TEN, 1952

1. Bicycle Thieves (De Sica, 1949) 25
2. City Lights (Chaplin, 1930) 19
3. The Gold Rush (Chaplin, 1925) 16
4. Battleship Potemkin (Eisenstein, 1925) 12
5. Louisiana Story (Fisher, 1947) 11
6. Greed (von Stroheim, 1924) 10
7. Le Jour (de la) Lève (Carré, 1938) 10
the top ten last time, and one whose recent revival, in the complete version, has added to its reputation. There were six silent films in the 1952 list against two this time—which was predictable. But the new list contains only one really recent picture, as with Bicycle Thieves on the last occasion.

Other points worth noting: the high place of Ugetsu Monogatari, never yet shown commercially in this country; the fact that the two Vigo features have gained so much in the voting; the startlingly few votes received by some films from the 1952 list—Louisiana Story (two), Le Million (three), Le Jour se Lève (one). Flaherty, Clair and Carné are not at the moment fashionable names; and Bergman, the most widely trumpeted film-maker of the last few years, is far down the list.

One giant has disappeared from the top ten: Chaplin. But we thought it would be interesting to supplement the list by totalling up votes by directors as well as by film titles. Here Chaplin remains close to the top, though, as with any film-maker who is remembered for the whole body of his work rather than for one masterpiece, the votes are split among a number of titles. Eisenstein, Chaplin, Renoir as the giants; Welles, Antonioni, Vigo as the experimentalists: this is how it looks in the perspective of 1962.

### A SELECTION OF LISTS

**HENRI AGEL (France)**
1. Sunrise
2. Broken Blossoms (Griffith)
3. City Lights
4. Greed
5. L’Atlantide
6. The Childhood of Maxim Gorki
7. Bicycle Thieves
8. Madame de... (Ophüls)
9. The Golden Coach (Renoir)
10. Voyage en Italie (Rossellini)

**EDGAR ANSTET (Great Britain)**
1. Bicycle Thieves
2. Wild Strawberries
3. Kameradschaft (Pabst)
4. La Strada (Fellini)
5. Battleship Potemkin
6. Earth
7. The Cranes are Flying (Kalatozov)
8. Les Enfants du Paradis (Carné)
9. The Grapes of Wrath (Ford)
10. Le Jour se Lève (Carné)

**GUIDO ARISTARCO (Italy)**
1. Chapaev (Vasiliev)
2. Monsieur Verdoux
3. Limelight
4. The Passion of Joan of Arc
5. Battleship Potemkin
6. Ivan the Terrible
7. La Terra Trena
8. Earth
9. Mother (Pudovkin)
10. Paisa (Rossellini)

**GUIDE BACHMANN (U.S.A.)**
1. L'Avventura
2. Ugetsu Monogatari
3. Sawdust and Tinsel (Bergman)
4. Chronicle d'un Eté (Rouch)
5. Citizen Kane
6. Miss Julie (Sjöberg)
7. The Gold Rush
8. Strike (Eisenstein)
9. La Règle du Jeu
10. Fires on the Plain (Ichikawa)

**PETER BAKER (Great Britain)**
1. Strike
2. The Gold Rush
3. Intolerance
4. Greed
5. Bicycle Thieves
6. La Grands Illusion
7. Citizen Kane
8. The Italian Straw Hat (Clair)
9. Kanal (Wajda)
10. L'Année Dernière à Marienbad

**JOSH BILLING (Great Britain)**
1. All Quiet on the Western Front (Milestone)
2. Moulin Rouge (Huston)
3. Richard III (Olivier)
4. Shane (Stevens)
5. Mutiny on the Bounty (Frank Lloyd)
6. Saturday Night and Sunday Morning (Reisz)
7. Ninotchka (Lubitsch)
8. The Third Man (Reed)
9. The Kid (Chaplin)
10. Ben-Hur (Wyler)

"...Although I see all foreign films I haven't included one because I flatly refuse to believe a person can fairly judge a 'talkie' spoken in a language that he cannot fully understand... But the critics—I'm a reviewer, which is a very different thing—are bound eagerly to step in where I fear to tread, so I'll hazard a guess at the result of the 1961 poll. The winner? Hiroshima, mon Amour."

**LEON BUKOWIECKI (Poland)**
1. Ugetsu Monogatari
2. The End of St. Petersburg (Pudovkin)
3. Citizen Kane
4. Bicycle Thieves
5. Greed
6. The Best Years of our Lives (Wyler)
7. Our Hospitality (Keaton)
8. Les Enfants du Paradis
9. Battleship Potemkin
10. Le Testament d'Orphée (Coeceau)

"...In my personal opinion the best known best pictures aren't—and many others are..."

"La Règle du Jeu".
GIULIO CESARE CASTELLO (Italy)
1. Wedding March (Stroheim)
2. La Grande Illusion (Eisenstein)
3. Alexander Nevsky (Eisenstein)
4. Day of Wrath (Dreyer)
5. Paisa (Rossellini)
6. Le Silence est d’Or (Clair)
7. La Terra Trema
8. Limelight
9. Hiroshima, mon Amour
10. La Dolce Vita (fellini)

“...I have selected not only ten single pictures, but also their directors; so when I say Nevsky I mean also Potemkin; when I say Day of Wrath I mean also The Passion of Joan of Arc...”

PAUL DEHN (Great Britain)
1. Metropolis (Lang)
2. City Lights
3. Citizen Kane
4. Henry V (Olivier)
5. Orphée (Cocteau)
6. Wild Strawberries
7. Umberto D
8. Nuit et Brouillard
9. Les Quatre Cents Coups (Truffaut)
10. A Taste of Honey (Richardson)

“The last-named is, of course, still so close that I can only gamble instinctively on its durability.”

JEAN DOUCHET (France)
1. The Empress Yang Kwei Fei (Mizoguchi)
2. The Tiger of Eschnapur (Lang)
3. Tabu (Flaherty)
4. Exodus (Preminger)
5. Rio Bravo (Hawks)
6. The Naked and the Dead (Walsh)
7. Vertigo (Hitchcock)
8. The General
9. Bigger than Life (Nicholas Ray)
10. A Star is Born (Cukor)

“...J’ai cédé, en définitive, à une position esthétique générale qui m’a fait sacrifier Losey, Chaplin, Donskoi, Rossellini, Renoir, Minnelli, etc.”

PETER JOHN DYER (Great Britain)
1. Earth
2. L’Atalante
3. Ugetsu Monogatari
4. M (Lang)
5. Wagonmaster (Ford)
6. Tokyo Story
7. Tol’able David (King)
8. Signora senza Camelie (Antonioni)
9. Vampyr (Dreyer)
10. A Generation (Wajda)

LOTTE EISNER (France)
1. The Idiot (Kurosawa)
2. Ugetsu Monogatari
3. Nazarin
4. Ivan the Terrible (Colour Sequence, Part 2)
5. Monsieur Verdoux
6. Fires on the Plain
7. Greed
8. Sunrise
9. Partie de Campagne (Renoir)
10. Zéro de Conduite

“I do not believe in your formula of the ten best films—the ones I give you here are the ones I can see over and over again...”

JOHN GILLET (Great Britain)
1. The Devil is a Woman (Stromberg)
2. Earth
3. Listen to Britain (Jennings)
4. Nazarin
5. Our Hospitality
6. Pather Panchali
7. Que Viva Mexico! (Eisenstein)
8. La Regle du Jeu
9. Sansho Dayu (Mizoguchi)
10. Tokyo Story

CURTIS HARRINGTON (U.S.A.)
1. Greed
2. Zéro de Conduite
3. La Regle du Jeu
4. The Devil is a Woman
5. Dura Lex (Kuleshov)
6. Les Dames du Bois de Boulogne (Bresson)
7. Rashomon (Kurosawa)
8. I Vitelloni (fellini)
9. Citizen Kane
10. L’Avventura

DEREK HILL (Great Britain)
1. Ikiru
2. The Apu Trilogy
3. The Gorki Trilogy
4. L’Atalante
5. The Set Up (Robert Wise)
6. Fires Were Started (Jennings)
7. Hotel des Invalides (Franju)
8. O Dreamland (Anderson)

MARGARET HINXMAN (Great Britain)
1. L’Année Dernière à Marienbad
2. L’Atalante
3. L’Avventura
4. Citizen Kane
5. The General
6. Dead End (Wyler)
7. All Quiet on the Western Front
8. The Italian Straw Hat
9. Monsieur Verdoux
10. La Grande Illusion

PENELOPE HOUSTON (Great Britain)
1. Bicycle Thieves
2. Citizen Kane
3. City Lights
4. Hiroshima, mon Amour
5. Ikiru
6. The Maltese Falcon (Huston)
7. October
8. La Regle du Jeu
9. La Terra Trema
10. Ugetsu Monogatari

ARTHUR KNIGHT (U.S.A.)
1. Bicycle Thieves
2. Citizen Kane
3. City Lights
4. Hiroshima, mon Amour
5. Ikiru
6. The Last Laugh (Murnau)
7. Moana (Flaherty)
8. The Apu Trilogy
9. Battleship Potemkin
10. La Strada

ANDRE S. LABARTHE (France)
1. Pickpocket
2. The Night of the Hunter (Laughton)
3. L’Age d’Or (Buñuel)
4. Freaks (T. Browning)
5. La Pyramide Humaine (Rouch)
6. Anatomy of a Murder (Preminger)
7. Rio Bravo
8. Bébé mange sa Soupe (Lumiére)
9. Shin Heike Monogatari (Mizoguchi)
10. Les Vampires (Feuillade)

“...I have selected not only ten single pictures, but also their directors; so when I say Nevsky I mean also Potemkin; when I say Day of Wrath I mean also The Passion of Joan of Arc...”

No special order. “...J’ai volontairement passé sous silence les titres qui viendraient sous la plume de tout un chacun (Griffith, Stroheim, Murnau, Dreyer, Renoir, Rossellini, Hitchcock, Welles, Chaplin and quelques autres) préférant citer des films moins susceptibles de l’être... It is evident that this is not a list which was not treated differently from the one which is available now. Heureusement.”

GAVIN LAMBERT (Great Britain/U.S.A.)
1. L’Age d’Or
2. El (Buñuel)
3. Nazarin
4. Zéro de Conduite
5. Never Give a Sucker an Even Break (Edward Cline)
6. Ivan the Terrible
7. Modern Times ( Chaplin)
8. Moana
9. Love of Jeanne Ney (Fabst)
10. Gone With the Wind (Fleming)

“The task becomes rigorously unacademic for an ex-critic!”
DWIGHT MACDONALD (U.S.A.)
1. Birth of a Nation (Griffith)
2. Intolerance
3. October
4. Sherlock, Jr. (Keaton)
5. The Gorki Trilogy

"What no Chaplin, no Stroheim, no Dovzhenko, no Pudovkin, no Clair, no Pabst, no Murnau, no De Sica, no Rossellini, no Visconti, no Fellini, no Ford, no Wellman, no Flaherty! Well, it's your idea."

AITO MAKINEN (Finland)
1. Ugetsu Monogatari
2. Paather Panchali
3. La Terra Trema
4. Zéro de Conduite
5. Nanook of the North

ROGER MANVELL (Great Britain)
1. L'Avventura
2. Saturday Night and Sunday Morning
3. Louisiana Story (Flaherty)
4. Brief Encounter (Lean)
5. Intolerance

"For the first four titles I take history backwards, in other words select from among the films I have found most impressive or exciting or moving or influential in the search for new kinds of presentation or in the fulfillment of the older-established styles. For the next four I go back to the beginning and take from the silent period some of the films that still seem to me to matter most, even though they are by now ancient history, the great 'conventionals' which once broke convention. In between these groups lies the who e historical development of the sound film, . . ."

LOUIS MARCORELLES (France)
1. Poem of the Sea
2. Une Femme est une Femme (Godard)
3. Ivan the Terrible
4. Greed
5. The Passion of Joan of Arc

JONAS MEKAS (U.S.A.)
1. Battleship Potemkin
2. Citizen Kane
3. The Gold Rush
4. Greed
5. Intolerance

LUC MOULLET (France)
1. Voyage en Italie
2. La Grande Illusion
3. Les Enfants du Paradis
4. Hiroshima, mon Amour
5. L'Avventura

ENNO PATALAS (East Germany)
1. Chaplin's Mutual Films
2. La Terra Trema
3. La Régie du Jue
4. Citizen Kane
5. L'Avventura
6. Ivan the Terrible

DILYS POWELL (Great Britain)
1. City Lights
2. The General
3. The Italian Straw Hat
4. Monsieur Verdoux
5. Hail the Conquering Hero

DEREK PROUSE (Great Britain)
1. The Gold Rush
2. Qve Viva Mexico!
3. The Gorki Trilogy
4. The Childhood of Gorki
5. October

JEAN QUEVAL (France)
1. The Life of O-Haru
2. Rocco and his Brothers
3. The World of Apu (Ray)
4. L'Avventura

"...Of course it is impossible to make a beauty contest concerning works of art, but nevertheless: here is my personal choice, in chronological order..."

IB MONTY (Denmark)
1. Shoulder Arms (Chaplin)
2. Greed
3. The Navigator (Keaton/Donald Crisp)
4. Zéro de Conduite
5. Partie de Campagne

GENE MOSKOWITZ (U.S.A.)
1. The Life of O-Haru (Mizoguchi)
2. Rocco and his Brothers (Visconti)
3. The World of Apu (Ray)
4. L'Avventura
5. Nazarin
6. The Quiet Man (Ford)
7. Limelight
8. Ivan the Terrible
9. Greed
10. Earth

"...Above list ludicrous. Made up partly through elimination of the best. Couldn't decide which best work by Vigo, Prevert-Carné, Renoir, Flaherty, Visconti, Bergman, Buñuel, Stroheim. So left them out... swear not to play your game ten years hence."
KAREL REISZ (Great Britain)
1. L'Atalante
2. City Lights
3. Earth
4. Listen to Britain
5. Los Olvidados (Buñuel)
6. Palm Beach Story (Sturges)
7. Wagonmaster
8. L'Avventura
9. Umberto D
10. Due Soldi di Speranza (Castellani)

JACQUES RIVETTE (France)
1. The Life of O-Haru
2. Germany Year Zero (Rossellini)
3. True Heart Susie (Griffith)
4. Sunrise
5. The River (Renoir)
6. Ivan the Terrible
7. L'Atalante
8. Day of Wrath
9. Monsieur Verdoux
10. Confidential Report (Welles)

DAVID ROBINSON (Great Britain)
1. Viridiana (Buñuel)
2. La Terra Trema
3. City Lights
4. The Apu Trilogy
5. The Gorki Trilogy
6. Ivan the Terrible
7. Tokyo Story
8. Wedding March
9. Les Quatre Cents Coups
10. Anthology of the works of W. C. Fields

ERIC ROHMER (France)
1. True Heart Susie
2. The General
3. Sunrise
4. La Règle du Jeu
5. Ivan the Terrible
6. Voyage en Italie
7. Red River (Hawks)
8. Vertigo
9. Pickpocket
10. La Pyramide Humaine

RICHARD ROUD (U.S.A./Great Britain)
1. L'Année Dernière à Marienbad
2. L'Atalante
3. Citizen Kane
4. Cronaca di un Amore (Antonioni)
5. Les Dames du Bois de Boulogne
6. Hiroshima, mon Amour
7. La Notte
8. Pickpocket
9. La Règle du Jeu
10. Tokyo Story

GEORGES SADOUL (France)
1. Battleship Potemkin
2. Modern Times
3. Toni (Reinor)
4. Mother
5. Earth
6. Le Million (Clair)
7. Greed
8. Bicycle Thieves
9. Ugetsu Monogatari
10. Hiroshima, mon Amour

JACQUES SICLER (France)
1. Intolerance
2. Nosferatu (Murnau)
3. The Gold Rush
4. La Règle du Jeu
5. Citizen Kane
6. Ivan the Terrible
7. Sensso (Visconti)
8. Voyage en Italie
9. Vertigo
10. Pickpocket

JOHN RUSSELL TAYLOR (Great Britain)
1. Journal d'un Curé de Campagne (Bresson)
2. Orphée
3. The Magnificent Ambersons
4. Singin' in the Rain (Kelly/Donen)
5. Triumph of the Will (Riefenstahl)
6. The Spiral Staircase (Siodmak)
7. The General
8. Kind Hearts and Coronets (Hammer)
9. Senso
10. Sunrise

ROBERT VAS (Hungary/Great Britain)
1. Ashes and Diamonds (Wajda)
2. A Diary for Timothy (Jennings)
3. The Grapes of Wrath
4. The Great Citizen (Erlmer)
5. Ikiru
6. Journal d'un Curé de Campagne
7. Los Olvidados
8. Our Hospitality
9. La Règle du Jeu
10. Umberto D

ILYA VEISFELD (U.S.S.R.)
1. Battleship Potemkin
2. The Gold Rush
3. Earth
4. La Grande Illusion
5. Bicycle Thieves
6. The Red Balloon (Lamarisse)
7. Ballad of a Soldier (Chukhray)
8. Mother Joan of the Angels
9. The Naked Island (Kaneto Shindo)
10. Tutti a Casa (Comencini)

ALEXANDER WALKER (Great Britain)
1. Viridiana
2. Citizen Kane
3. Wild Strawberries
4. L'Avventura
5. La Règle du Jeu
6. The Gold Rush
7. Hiroshima, mon Amour
8. La Terra Trema
9. Some Like it Hot (Wilder)
10. A Bout de Souffle (Godard)

"... My guess is that La Règle du Jeu will occupy the same position in your list as Bicycle Thieves did last time."

ARCHER WINSTEN (U.S.A.)
1. Farrebique (Rouquier)
2. The Stars Look Down (Reed)
3. Our Town (Sam Wood)
4. Bicycle Thieves
5. Day of Wrath
6. Henry V
7. The Asphalt Jungle (Huston)
8. The Apu Trilogy
9. Hiroshima, mon Amour
10. L'Avventura

COLIN YOUNG (U.S.A.)
1. Citizen Kane
2. The Gold Rush
3. Man of Aran (Flaherty)
4. October
5. Song of Ceylon (Wright)
6. L'Avventura
7. Pather Panchali
8. Rashomon
9. The Seventh Seal
10. Umberto D

"Ugetsu Monogatari"