It is ten years since SIGHT AND SOUND last invited critics to play the Top Ten game. We had first done it back in 1952, when it seemed a good idea to find out what critics thought in answer to a Brussels referendum among film-makers. (On that occasion, Bicycle Thieves, City Lights, The Gold Rush and Potemkin were top four for both critics and film-makers.) In our January 1962 issue we repeated the exercise; and we felt we couldn't let this anniversary pass without staging a third round.

Obviously, Top Ten lists are best approached with trepidation or amusement by compilers and with some scepticism by readers. It's manifestly impossible to name the 'best' of anything; but it's fractionally less impossible to come up with a list of personal choices. Critics, as in 1962, were

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The top ten, 1962</th>
<th>Voting by Directors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Citizen Kane (Welles, 1941)</td>
<td>Orson Welles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>La Règle du Jeu (Renoir, 1939)</td>
<td>Jean Renoir</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Battleship Potemkin (Eisenstein, 1925)</td>
<td>Ingmar Bergman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8½ (Fellini, 1963)</td>
<td>Luis Buñuel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L’Avventura (Antonioni, 1960)</td>
<td>Sergei Eisenstein</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Persona (Bergman, 1967)</td>
<td>John Ford</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Passion of Joan of Arc (Dreyer, 1928)</td>
<td>Jean-Luc Godard</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The General (Keaton/Brackman, 1926)</td>
<td>Buster Keaton</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Magnificent Ambersons (Welles, 1942)</td>
<td>Federico Fellini</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ugetsu Monogatari (Mizoguchi, 1953)</td>
<td>Michelangelo Antonioni</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wild Strawberries (Bergman, 1957)</td>
<td>Charles Chaplin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Carl Dreyer</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Runners-up</th>
<th>Top Ten</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Gold Rush (Chaplin, 1925)</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hiroshima mon Amour (Resnais, 1959)</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ikiru (Kurosawa, 1952)</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ivan the Terrible (Eisenstein, 1943-46)</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pierrot le Fou (Goddard, 1965)</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vertigo (Hitchcock, 1958)</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>La Grande Illusion (Renoir, 1937)</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meuhette (Bresson, 1966)</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Searchers (Ford, 1956)</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunrise (Murnau, 1927)</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001: A Space Odyssey (Kubrick, 1968)</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Viridiana (Buñuel, 1961)</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
invited to be as subjective and idiosyncratic as they choose—to list the films they would personally want to see again, or could least imagine having to live without, rather than to try to think themselves into positions of impossible objectivity. We wanted to see, among other things, how the screen classics stood up in the light of 1972, how much the international critical consciousness might have shifted in the ten figure of ten. ‘Plus, plus, plus . . .’ comes the repeated cry. Several people have made a point of precisely dating their lists: on another day, at another hour, the titles would be different. We also apologize to critics whose lists reached us too late for publication, though we have been able to add their votes to the main tally. Altogether, 89 critics’ views are represented.

And what emerges? First, something very obvious, but perhaps worth repeating: that film really is the most international of all the arts which use the written or spoken word. It would often be difficult to guess from the individual list which continent, let alone which country, the critic came from. Though, again, there are exceptions. Anita Malik is one of several people who have pointed out the problems and restrictions on actually seeing films. ‘For instance,’ she writes, ‘had I seen all the Buñuel’s my choice might not have been Nazarin. Having seen only Los Olvidados and Nazarin, I am putting the second in more as a vote for Buñuel.’

Again, Citizen Kane tops the list—strangely, it didn’t even make the top ten back in 1952. Philip French’s unerringly accurate prediction—Kane and La Règle du Jeu out in front, L’Avventura and Bicycle Thieves off the list, and 81 and Persona as likeliest newcomers—missed out only on the L’Avventura guess. Kane and La Règle du Jeu, respectively first and third in a close-run finish in 1962, have this time left the rest of the field standing. In general, the enormous range of individual choices reflects what one would expect: a more splintered, fragmented film culture. But in another sense that is belied by the agreement on these two films.

The final consensus is also rather strikingly on the side of the classics. In 1952 Bicycle Thieves (1949) topped the poll; in 1962 L’Avventura (1960) took second place and Hiroshima mon amour (1959) led the runners-up. This time round, the only 1960s films come from Bergman and Fellini, neither of whom could exactly be called new men. In the voting, the underground remains largely underground; Pierrot le Fou wins out over the political Godard of recent years; and there’s surprisingly little evidence of what is sometimes suggested as another mood of the times—a move away from fiction towards fact. No one, incidentally, listed a television film.

Buster Keaton was probably the great rediscovery of the 1960s, and among directors Keaton just edges past Chaplin. But if there are surprises, they are less in what’s new than in some apparent re-

---

**Critics’ Lists**

**Jan Aghed**

Swedish SYDVENSKA DAGBLADET SNOFFPORTEN


... A silly and extremely unpleasant little master, which is just the film from which I extract myself with the above, partly no doubt ephemeral list, and profound guilt feelings towards many absentees.

Adriano Aprà

Italy FILMSTUDIO 70

Chronicle of Anna Magdalena Bach, La Concentration (Philipp Garrel), Ice (Robert Kramer), Mare’s Tail (David Larcher), My Hustler (Vernon), Nosra Signora de l’Ufficio (Gandini), Bente, Partisan Zenshi (Noriochi Tsuchimoto), Pierrot le Fou, He Died After The War (Oshima), L’Ue aux Coudres Trilogy (Pierre Perrault), Films of the sixties made by directors of the sixties.

**Francisco Aranda**

Spain

L’Age d’Or, Battleship Potemkin, Citizen Kane, Monsieur Verdoux, The Passion of Joan of Arc, Paths of Glory, Tabu, La Terra Terna, Haxan (Christensen), You Only Live Once.

**José Carlos Avellan**

Brazil JORNAL DO BRASIL

Pierrot le Fou, Ivan the Terrible, The Hour of the Wolf, Terra em Transe (Rocha), The Last Laugh (Lang), Le Monstre à Mariembad, Vidas Secas (Nelson Pereira dos Santos), Tristana, La Hora de los Hormos (Solana), Pickpocket.

**Gianalberto Bendazzi**

Italy AVANTI!

Battleship Potemkin, Man of Aran, The Passion of Joan of Arc, A Nous la Liberté, Sjö, Citizen Kane, Au Hasard, Balthazar, It’s a Wonderful Life (Capra), The Deserter and the Nomads (Jabishio), Pas de Deux (McLaren).

I give you my list not like a critic but like a spectator. These ten are the films I loved most and the reason was silent.

**Claude Beylie**

France CINEMA 71

Band of Angels (Walsh), Birth of a Nation, A Countess from Hong Kong, Gertrud, M (Lang), La Règle du Jeu, Sansho Dayu, Shanghai Gesture, Sunrise, Young Mr. Lincoln.

**Stig Björkman**

Sweden CHAPLIN

Citizen Kane, Vertigo, Pierrot le Fou, Lola, L’Avventura, Rio Bravo, La Carrosse d’Or, Persona, Sherlock Jr., Les Vampires (Pussaide).

Regrettably, I have had to disregard film-makers like Buñuel and Chabrol, Lewis and Lessov, Mizoguchi and Rossellini, Vardon and Vigo, or singular masterpieces like ‘Freuds’ or ‘Night of the Hunter’.

**Peter Bogdanovich**

United States


I don’t have a favourite movies as much as I have favourite directors—men whose company I enjoy. And it depends very much on my mood which of their various works I feel like being with. Whether I want to be in the presence of Hawks in his ‘Bringing Up Baby’ mood or his ‘Only Angels Have Wings’ mood. This is, at best, a rough list based on an attempt to guess which mood I’m most in, the order is chronological.

**Jaroslav Broz**

Czechoslovakia


... Films of still established directors released during the last fifteen years.

**Eduardo Bruno**

Italy FILMCRITICA


Un programma incompleto che mi piacerebbe vedere come esempio di un ‘cinema di tendenza’.

**Felix Bucher**

Switzerland


Andrei Roubolev
I rather resist letting these films be identified by the director’s name alone. Perhaps half of them are distinguished as much by the writing... 

Jaime E. Costa
Uruguay CINE UNIVERSITARIO
Citizen Kane, La Dolce Vita, Hamlet (Olivier), Les Quatre Cents Coups, Singin’ in the Rain, An American in Paris, A Star is Born (Cooper), Some Like It Hot, North by Northwest, My Darling Clementine.

Peter Cowie
Great Britain INTERNATIONAL FILM GUIDE
This choice consists unashamedly of films I like more each time I see them, films that are all incorcorably romantic.

Edgardo Cozarinsky
Argentina
True Heart Susie, Sunrise, Trouble in Paradise, La Rêgle du Jeu, My Darling Clementine, The Fountainhead (Vidor), Vertigo, Persona, Deus ou Choix que je sais d’aille, Fritz Lang’s complete works as one multi-episodic film.
October 11, 1973, 4 p.m. ... two days later or one hour earlier my choice could have been either.

Judith Crist
United States NEW YORK MAGAZINE
City Lights, La Rêgle du Jeu, Citizen Kane, La Grande Illusion, 8½, La Guerre est Finie, Bizarre, Winter Light, and Peace (Bordarchuk), The Maltese Falcon.

Adina Darian
Romania CINEMA
The Cameraman, Ivan the Terrible, Citizen Kane, Bicycle Thieves, Hamlet (Olivier), Salvatore Giuliano, Blow-Up, If, ... Romeo and Juliet (Zeffirelli), Bunch Cassidy and the Sundance Kid.

Jan Dawson
Great Britain MONTHLY FILM BULLETIN
An alphabetical list that got as far as “P” ... very unfair to “The Red Desert,” “La Rêgle du Jeu,” “The Spider’s Strategy,” “Fire on the Fianistes,” “Walkabout” and “Westhead.”

Mauritz Edström
Sweden DAGERS NYHET
Los Olvidados, Nazarin, The Exterminating Angel, The General, Day of Wrath, Mouchette, La Jetée (Marker), Teorema, The Iron Horse, La Hora de los Hornos (Solanar).
This is just a contemporary choice. I have classics too! The whole list could have been Buñuel, the most classic and most contemporary of them all.

Lotte Eisner
France
Earth, Greed, Ivan the Terrible (Part Two, colour sequences), The Idiot (Kurosawa), M (Lang), Monsieur Verdoux, The Passion of Joan of Arc, La Rêgle du Jeu, Senso, Sunrise.

Allen Eyles
Great Britain FOCUS ON FILM
Late Autumn (Ozu), She Wore a Yellow Ribbon, Intolerance, The Magnificent Ambersons, A Night at the Opera, Le Amiche, Palm Beach Story (Sturges), Summer Holiday (Mamoulian), Duel in the Sun, Ride the High Country (Pescipina).
This is today’s list, not yesterday’s, not tomorrow’s ...

Stephen Farber
United States
Citizen Kane, 8½, Jules et Jim, Lawrence of Arabia (the uncut version), The Manchurian Candidate, Moustapha Méminin: The Night of the Hunter, Performance, Persona, La Rêgle du Jeu.

Jean-Paul Fargier, Gerard LeBlanc
France CINÉTHIQUE
British Sounds, Chapayeve, The East is Red (Anon: China), Enthusiasm (Verton), Forward, Soviet (Verton), Lotte in Italia (Godard), Pravda (Godard), Red Detachment of Women (Anon: China), The Sixth Part of the World (Verton), Un Film comme les Autres (Godard).
Voici notre liste des dix meilleurs films de ce que les critiques de cinéma appellent “l’histoire du cinéma”.

Goffredo Fofi
Italy OMBRE BOSSE
Citizen Kane, La Rêgle du Jeu, October, Modern Times, M (Lang), Viridiana, Paisa, Day of Wrath, The Servant, La Hora de los Hornos (Solanar).

Philip French
Great Britain
Strictly a Desert Island selection, though I wouldn’t be happy about a Ten Best list that didn’t include a thriller, a silent comedy, a Western and a musical. Only four of my ten favourite directors are represented.

John Gillett
Great Britain
L’Avventura, Early Autumn (Ozu), Happiness (Medvedkin), Ivan the Terrible, Nazarin, Olympic Games 1936 (Riefenstahl), La Rêgle du Jeu, Sansho Dayu, The Searchers, Seven ... and it breaks my heart to exclude Stroheim, Ophuls and Dreyer.

Penelope Gilliatt
Great Britain THE NEW YORKER
... and I can’t find the room I should for ‘Zéro de Conduite’.

Verina Galessner
Great Britain TIME OUT
The Man with the Movie Camera, Happiness (Medvedkin), King Kong, The Shams, Wave-length (Mike Snow), The Boy (Oshima), Chelsea Girls, Nosferatu, Le Boucher, Sex and the Single Girl (Quine).

Giovanni Grazzini
Italy CORRIERE DELLA SERA
Battleship Potemkin, The Circus, La Grande Lactée.
Illusion, Bicycle Thieves, 81, Antonio das Mortes, The Passion of Joan of Arc, Silence and Cry (Jancsó), Mouchette, Andrei Roubliev.

Nina Hibbin
Great Britain MORNING STAR

Margaret Hinman
Great Britain SUNDAY TELEGRAPH
All Quiet on the Western Front, Citizen Kane, Gone with the Wind, Letter from an Unknown Woman, Accident, Tristan, The Grapes of Wrath, Wild Strawberries, Sunset Boulevard, La Grande Illusion.

Penelope Houston
Great Britain SIGHT AND SOUND
Au Hasard, Balhaazar, Charulata, Citizen Kane, The Eclipse, The General, Miracle of Morgan’s Creek (Sturges), Muriel, La Règle du Jeu, Silence and Cry (Jancsó), 2001: A Space Odyssey.

‘Miracle of Morgan’s Creek’

Gilles Jacob
France

Stanley Kauffmann
United States NEW REPUBLIC

Arthur Knight
United States SATURDAY REVIEW
A Nous la Liberté, Bicycle Thieves, Citizen Kane, City Lights, Ikiru, La Notte, The Passion of Joan of Arc, Persona, Punishment Park (Peter Watkins), Who’s Afraid of Virginia Woolf?

Onat Kutlar
Turkey FILM

John Francis Lane
Great Britain/Italy
Intolerance, The Passion of Joan of Arc, Battleship Potemkin, Modern Times, Citizen Kane, Rome, Open City, I Vitelloni, Wild Strawberries, L’avventura, À Bout de Souffle. Obviously these are not my ten favourite films of all time: they are those that, according to my vision of the cinema, represent the ten most influential films in the history of the cinema.

Jay Leyda
United States
L’Age d’Or, Rashomon, The World of Apu, 84, Storm (Chin Shun), The Shame, The Money Order (Sendone), Andrei Roubliev, The Conformist, Day by Day (Jodlaim).

Anthony Macklin
United States FILM HERITAGE

Derek Malcolm
Great Britain THE GUARDIAN
Earth, Sons of the Desert (Laurel and Hardy), La Règle du Jeu, Fantasia, The Magnificent Seven, Day of Wrath, Ugetsu Monogatari, Wild Strawberries, An Autumn Afternoon, Vivre sa Vie.

Gene Moskowitz
United States VARIETY
Young Mr. Lincoln, The Life of O-Haru (Mizoguchi), Limelight, A Generation, Earth, La Règle du Jeu, Ivan the Terrible, No Greater Glory (Borzage), Andrei Roubliev, Tristan.

Rui Nogueira
France
America, America, Os Deuses e o Mortes (Guerra), The Devil is a Woman, Gertrud, Her Man (Jay Garnett), Only Angels Have Wings, Queen Kelly, A Star is Born (Cukor), Sunrise, They Died With Their Boots On (Walsh).

Enno Patalas
West Germany FILMKRITIK
Intolerance (sonorized and tinted version), Austernprinzessin (Labisch), Phantom (Murnau), The Saga of Anatahan, Gertrud, Pierrot le Fou, Deus e o Diabo na Terra do Sol (Rocha), Chronicle of Anna Magdalena Bach, Neurosis (Werner Schroeter), Vent d’Est.

Morten Piil
Denmark KOMORAMA

Dilsy Powell
Great Britain SUNDAY TIMES
Ashes and Diamonds, Belle de Jour, Citizen Kane, The General, The Lady with the Little Dog, The Last Day of Summer (Kornicki-Lasowski), Lonely Are the Brave (David Miller), Il Mare, Le Million, Rear Window.

‘Death in Venice’ is too recent, and anyway I feel like giving some of the great current names—Visconti, Antonioni, Fellini, Renzoni, Renzoni—a rest. Resisting the temptation to list ten of the short Laurel and Hardy jokes . . .

‘Twentieth Century’

Ib Monty

Morando Morandini
Italy
Wild Strawberries, Un Condannato à Mort s’est Échappé, Nazarin, Day of Wrath, Ivan the Terrible, Ugetsu Monogatari, La Grande Illusion, La Guerre est Finie, Païsa, Senso.

I’ve played the game with sound films . . . It’s a pity for my beloved Keaton, Chaplin, Murnau, Stroheim . . .
Bjorn Rasmussen
Denmark
Plus, plus, plus... from now on, "S and S" must stand for 'Sadists of Cinema'...

David Robinson
Great Britain FINANCIAL TIMES
The Wedding March, L'AGE d'OR, Our Hospitality, L'Enfant Sauvage, Le Mépris (Menis), Tokyo Story, City Lights, La Règle du Jeu, Belle de Jour, Stagecoach.

Richard Roux
United States/Great Britain

Andrew Sarris
United States VILLAGE VOICE
Madame De... Lola Montes, Ugetsu Monogatari, La Règle du Jeu, Vertigo, The Searchers, Sherlock Jr., Francesco Giullare di Dio (Rossellini), Magnificent Ambersons, Belle de Jour.

Tadao Sato
Japan

Hans Schiller
Sweden SVENSKA DAGBLADET
Sunrise, Zéro de Conduite, La Règle du Jeu, Ugetsu Monogatari, Bande à Part, Gertrud, Marnie, Blow-Up, Mouchette, Rendez-vous à Bray (Delvaux).

Siegfried Schober
West Germany BÖDTEISCHE ZEITUNG
Citizen Kane, The Birds, Viaggio in Italia, Antonio das Mortes, Partner (Bertolucci), Pierrot le Fou, La Règle du Jeu, Chelsea Girls, L'Amour Fou (Rivette), To Have and Have Not.

Paul Schrader
United States CINEMA

'Sansão Dasu'

Your ten film limit stipulation... threatens to reduce the critic to a familiar litany of 'Introduction to the Art of the Cinema' greats. Therefore I have let Jennings ('Pirates Were Started'), Welle's 'Touch of Evil' and Murian ('Nosferatu') suffer at the hands of Aldrich, Kubrick and Gummill/Royce, but what of 'Comanche Station', 'Naked Spur' and 'Gun Crazy'?

Josef Stryck
Israel HAARETZ
Umberto D, The Czech Year (Trka), Ikiru, Eva (Loyc), The Invention of Evil (Karel Zeman), Five Easy Pieces (Rafelson), Wild Strawberries, 8½, Closely Observed Trains, To Be Or Not To Be (Lubitsch), 'Bicycle Thieves' and 'Citizen Kane' are the kind of films I ought to see again... Here are the films I like to see again, today and at this moment.

Elliott Stein
United States
The Bat Whispers (Roland West), The Bride of Frankenstein (Whale), The Dance of Life (John Cruound), Das Stahliter (Willy Zilchik), Gertrud, King Kong, The Magnificent Ambersons, Peter Pan (Breen), Scorpio Rising (Anger), An Actor's Revenge.

Philip Strick
Great Britain

John Russell Taylor
Great Britain TIMES
Le Journal d'un Cure de Campagne, Funny Face, 8½, The General, Triumph of the Will, The Old Dark House (Whale), La Voile Lactée, Psycho, King Hearts and Coronets, Teorema, Tomorrow I might change half the list, but there would be still one Keaton, one Breston, one Fellini, one Buñuel, one Hitchcock, one musical, one horror film... I think!

Christian Braad Thomsen
Denmark
A Bout de Souffle, Pierrot le Fou, Weekend, Antonio das Mortes, Der Leone Have Sept Cabeces (Rouch), Os Desvies e es Mortes (Guerra), Lola, Tires on the Pianiste, La Peau Douce, Au Hasard, Bahazart.

Véra Volmante
France
Wild Strawberries, 8½, Fellini-Satyricon, Ivan the Terrible, L'Avventura, Hiroshima mon Amour, Andrei Roublev, Johnny Got His Gun (Dalton Trumbo), The Go-Between...

Fils I'd most like to see again... and again... and again.

'Le Chat au Meir'

Robin Wood
Great Britain
Sansho Dayu, Letter from an Unknown Woman, A Passion, La Règle du Jeu, Rio Bravo, Sunrise, Vertigo, Bigger than Life (Nicholas Ray), Days and Nights in the Forest (Sayaagi Ray), Viaggio in Italia.

Francis Wyndham
Great Britain SUNDAY TIMES MAGAZINE
Alice Adams (Steele), Battle of Algiers, Citizen Kane, Les Dames du Bois de Boulogne, Le Deuxième Souffle (Malle), The Eclipse, Flesh (Paul Morrissey), Imitation of Life (Sark), Meet Me in St. Louis, A Star is Born (Cukor).

Paul D. Zimmerman
United States NEWSDAY