



1952 1962 1972

Bicycle Thieves/De Sica	1949	25
City Lights/Chaplin	1930	19
The Gold Rush/Chaplin	1925	19
Battleship Potemkin/Eisenstein	1925	16
Louisiana Story/Flaherty	1947	12
Intolerance/Griffith	1916	12
Greed/von Stroheim	1924	11
Le Jour se Lève/Carné	1939	11
Passion of Joan of Arc/Dreyer	1928	11
Brief Encounter/Lean	1945	10
Le Million/Clair	1930	10
La Règle du Jeu/Renoir	1939	10

Citizen Kane/Welles	1941	22
L'Avventura/Antonioni	1960	20
La Règle du Jeu/Renoir	1939	19
Greed/von Stroheim	1924	17
Ugetsu Monogatari/Mizoguchi	1953	17
Battleship Potemkin/Eisenstein	1925	16
Bicycle Thieves/De Sica	1949	16
Ivan the Terrible/Eisenstein	1943-46	16
La Terra Trema/Visconti	1948	14
L'Atalante/Vigo	1933	13

Citizen Kane/Welles	1941	32
La Règle du Jeu/Renoir	1939	28
Battleship Potemkin/Eisenstein	1925	16
8½/Fellini	1963	15
L'Avventura/Antonioni	1960	12
Persona/Bergman	1967	12
Passion of Joan of Arc/Dreyer	1928	11
The General/Keaton	1926	10
The Magnificent Ambersons/ Welles	1942	10
Ugetsu Monogatari/Mizoguchi	1953	9
Wild Strawberries/Bergman	1957	9

This is the fourth time that SIGHT AND SOUND has invited critics to play the Top Ten game. The exercise began back in 1952, to complement a Brussels referendum among film-makers. Since then, the temptation to test the critical climate every ten years, to find out whether the old assumptions still hold and how great is the impact of new films and ideas, has so far proved irresistible.

In writing to ask critics for their votes, we suggested that 1982 might well turn out to be the final replay, on the eve of the onslaught by video, cable, satellite and laser disc. The idea has always been 'Top Ten' rather than 'Best'. We have asked as many critics as we could muster to name the films that have been for them the most relevant, stimulating or plainly enjoyable, their choices for a desert island or their first entries in a cassette collection. Personal choice, open to idiosyncrasy and the mood of the moment, is less daunting than some impossible objective assessment. But as the range of material steadily widens, along with changes in the methods of transmitting or distributing it, the whole exercise becomes increasingly difficult—even perhaps constricting. Apart from Geoffrey Nowell-Smith, whose list is

made up of short films, most critics hold to the orthodoxy of the theatrical fiction feature, no longer by any means the dominant form. We also seriously wondered whether any consensus view would emerge, given the range of approaches to film criticism currently being practised and the fact that to name merely a film and a director inevitably smacks of *auteurism*. Bob Baker of *Film Dope* suggested that we might find 247 titles fighting for first place; we would not ourselves have been surprised.

The range of titles that turn up in individual lists is probably greater than ever. But when the votes are totted up, it appears that astonishingly little has changed—a conclusion likely to depress some as much as it may reassure others. *Citizen Kane*, a narrow winner in 1962 and an outright winner in 1972, has pulled clean away from the field; *La Règle du Jeu* remains runner-up; *Battleship Potemkin* is still there. Even the newcomers to the top ten are very old stagers: *Seven Samurai*, now available in its splendid full-length version, *Singin' in the Rain*, which seems to have been with us for ever and perhaps stands up to repeated TV screenings better than some of its contemporaries, and two runners-up from 1972, *Vertigo* and *The Searchers*, whose elevation is unlikely to surprise anyone.

The most recent film is *8½*, made almost twenty years ago. Is this rather overwhelming vote for the past a sign that film criticism is becoming an ageing profession, which may be the case? Is it that movies are not what they used to be? Or that younger critics are less confident about their immediate enthusiasms than those of 1952, when a new film, *Bicycle Thieves*, came out on top, or 1962, when another new film, *L'Avventura*, was runner-up? Whatever the reason, the films and film-makers of the 1970s come out rather poorly, in individual lists as well as in the final count.

In 1972 we suggested that the exercise was not to be taken too seriously and that it would be rash to risk generalisations on the basis of shaky evidence. All the same, there are undoubted

pointers, such as a vote for Hitchcock which reflects the hard work of the Hitchcock critical industry in the last two decades. The big names of the 1960s—Antonioni and Bergman and Godard—were likely to lose ground, given the pendulum swing of fashion. In fact they have lost less than might have been expected, and Fellini stoutly holds his place. We also noted ten years ago that the 60s 'had produced nothing to equal in worldwide impact the effect of neo-realism in the 40s or of everything summed up in the phrase "new wave" at the end of the 50s. The discoveries of the past decade have been of the kind that split rather than unite critical opinion; and when the votes are added agreement settles on the proven masters.' That comment survives unchanged ten years later. And in 1992, if there should be another round of the game, we won't be at all surprised if the verdict is still *Citizen Kane* first, the rest nowhere.

As to some details of the poll, we invited critics to include films made for television or video, though not TV programmes as such (one TV series has been listed, by Ivor Montagu, and it would be churlish to banish it). We wanted to publish all the 122 lists we received, and to save space have taken a rather arbitrary line about identifying directors, doing so only when a title might seem obscure or unfamiliar or when there might be confusion over similar or identical titles or between different versions of a play or novel. Titles are given in the form in which they are most generally recognisable in Britain—with apologies to overseas readers.

Finally, we would like to thank all the critics who have sent us their lists and their comments (regretting that we have not space to publish more of the latter). An individual list sometimes signals its country of origin, more often not, and the film community remains genuinely and encouragingly international. The fact that Japanese critics admire Willi Forst, or that Finns vote for Ozu, might seem surprising if one were talking about the equivalent novels or plays or television programmes. With movies we take this sort of thing for granted.

TOP TEN 1982

TOP TEN

Citizen Kane/Welles	1941	45
La Règle du Jeu/Renoir	1939	31
Seven Samurai/Kurosawa	1954	15
Singin' in the Rain/Donen & Kelly	1952	15
8½/Fellini	1963	14
Battleship Potemkin/Eisenstein	1925	13
L'Avventura/Antonioni	1960	12
The Magnificent Ambersons/Welles	1942	12
Vertigo/Hitchcock	1958	12
The General/Keaton & Bruckman	1926	11
The Searchers/Ford	1956	11

RUNNERS-UP

2001: A Space Odyssey/Kubrick	1968	10
Andrei Roublev/Tarkovsky	1966	10
Greed/von Stroheim	1924	9
Jules et Jim/Truffaut	1961	9
The Third Man/Reed	1949	9

DIRECTORS

Orson Welles	71
Jean Renoir	51
Charles Chaplin	37
John Ford	34
Luis Buñuel	33
Akira Kurosawa	33
Federico Fellini	32
Alfred Hitchcock	32
Jean-Luc Godard	30
Buster Keaton	30

Critics' Lists

B. ABDOU

Algeria Les Deux Ecrans
Another Way (Karoly Makk), Andrei Roublev, The Asphalt Jungle, Battleship Potemkin, Citizen Kane, Les Dupes (Toufik Salah), Et Le Caire Repond (Y. Chahine), Georgia's Friends (Penn), The Kid, Nah'la (Farouk Beloufa).

GILBERT ADAIR

UK
L'Argent (L'Herbier), Les Dames du Bois de Boulogne, Limelight, La Nuit du Carrefour (Renoir), Playtime, Sunrise, Le Testament d'Orphée, Trouble in Paradise, Vampyr, Vertigo.

LARS AHLANDER

Sweden Chaplin
Bicycle Thieves, Citizen Kane, 8½, Les Enfants du Paradis, La Règle du Jeu, Sayat Nova (Paradjanov), Seven Samurai, Stalker, Wild Strawberries, Zigeunerweisen (Seijun Suzuki).

NIGEL ANDREWS

UK Financial Times
Aguirre, Wrath of God, Bring Me the Head of Alfredo Garcia (Peckinpah), Citizen Kane, Gertrud, Lola (Fassbinder), The Passenger (Antonioni), Persona, The Seventh Victim (Mark Robson), 2001: A Space Odyssey, Vertigo.

EDGAR ANSTEY

UK
Citizen Kane, Earth, Casablanca, The Cranes Are Flying, The Ghost That Never Returns, Song of Ceylon, In the Heat of the Night, Fires Were Started, Terminus (John Schlesinger).

MARTYN AUTY

UK Time Out
Kings of the Road, Mean Streets, Orphée, Our Hospitality, Pierrot le Fou, Phantom Lady, Psycho, Strike, Sunrise, Zorns Lemma (Hollis Frampton).

BOB BAKER

UK Film Dope
A Day Out (Stephen Frears: made for TV), Days of Heaven, La Gueule Ouverte (Pialat), Lazybones (Borzage), The Night of the Hunter, Le Plaisir, La Poulette Grise (McLaren), Tirez sur le Pianiste, Wild River, The World of Apu. It will indeed be interesting to see if there's still any consensus. I suspect 247 movies will tie for first place.

CHARLES BARR

UK
Ingeborg Holm (Sjöström), The End of St Petersburg, Random Harvest, A Canterbury Tale (Powell/Pressburger), The Pirate (Minnelli), Fort Apache, Rear Window, Sansho Dayu, Kiss Me Stupid, King Lear (Brook). Chronological order.

LASSE BERGSTROM

Sweden Expressen
The Adventures of Robin Hood, L'Avventura, Battleship Potemkin, The Birth of a Nation, Citizen Kane, 8½, Jules et Jim, Modern Times, My Darling Clementine, Wild Strawberries.

CLAUDE BEYLIE

France L'Avant-Scène Cinéma
Le Voyage à travers l'Impossible (Méliès), The Birth of a Nation, Sunrise, The Scarlet Empress, La Règle du Jeu, Le Plaisir, Sansho Dayu, Der Tiger von Eschnapur/Das Indische Grabmal (Lang), Gertrud, A Countess from Hong-Kong. Chronological order.

As to watching these films on a TV screen, no way! It is still possible, fortunately, to obtain prints.

MARJORIE BILBOW

UK Screen International
The Adventures of Robin Hood (Keighley/Curtiz), The African Queen, Bambi, The Band Wagon, Casablanca, David Copperfield (Cukor), A Matter of Life and Death, Stagecoach, The Third Man, The Wizard of Oz.

PETER BISKIND

USA American Film
The Godfather (Part I), Jaws, Kiss Me Deadly, Metropolis, Modern Times, On the Waterfront, Battleship Potemkin, La Règle du Jeu, Seven Samurai, Tout Va Bien.

PASCAL BONITZER

France Cahiers du Cinéma
City of Women, Limelight, Le Mépris, Moonfleet (Lang), Night of the Demon (Jacques Tourneur), Notorious, Ordet (Dreyer), Oyu-Sama (Mizoguchi), Parsifal (Syberberg), Touch of Evil.

GEOFF BROWN

UK Radio Times
The Bank Dick, La Belle et la Bête, Black Narcissus, King-size Canary (Tex Avery), Listen to Britain, Monsieur Verdoux, Mouchette, Perfect Day (James Parrott), Rainbow Dance (Len Lye), La Règle du Jeu.

PER CALUM

Denmark Kosmorama
The Cameraman, The Magnificent Ambersons, The Maltese Falcon, My Darling Clementine, The Quiet Man, Rio Bravo, She Wore a Yellow Ribbon, Singin' in the Rain, To Have and Have Not, 2001: A Space Odyssey.

VINCENT CANBY

USA New York Times
City Lights, The Discreet Charm of the Bourgeoisie, Jules et Jim, The Magnificent Ambersons, Nights of Cabiria, Playtime, La Règle du Jeu, Sherlock Jr., Singin' in the Rain, Some Like It Hot.

MICHEL CIMENT

France Positif
Ugetsu Monogatari, Sherlock Jr., La Règle du Jeu, The Discreet Charm of the Bourgeoisie, Madame de..., Sunrise, My Darling Clementine, Touch of Evil, Singin' in the Rain, 8½.

Not to look biased I did not mention any of my favourite films of directors to whom I devoted or will devote shortly a book or a film, but which of course form the 'shadow cabinet' of my 'official' list: The Wedding March (Stroheim), The Music Room (Ray), Wild River (Kazan), Salvatore Giuliano (Rosi), Accident (Losey), 2001: A Space Odyssey (Kubrick), The Private Life of Sherlock Holmes (Wilder), Puzzle of a Downfall Child (Schatzberg), Leo the Last (Boorman), The Travelling Players (Angelopoulos).

LORENZO CODELLI

Italy
Barry Lyndon, Days of Heaven, Heaven Can Wait, The Long Goodbye, Red Hot Riding Hood (Tex Avery), Some Like It Hot, Sullivan's Travels, Totò a Colori (Steno), The Unknown (Browning), Wild River.



JOHN COLEMAN

UK New Statesman
Boudou Sauvè des Eaux, The Cameraman (Keaton), Charulata, L'Enfant Sauvage, Gregory's Girl, Ikiru, The Lady with the Little Dog (Heifits), The Magnificent Ambersons, Singin' in the Rain, Smiles of a Summer Night.

RICHARD COMBS

UK Monthly Film Bulletin
Barry Lyndon + Day of the Fight (Kubrick), Dream Street (Griffith), Escape from Alcatraz (Siegel), Le Feu Follet, Major Dundee, 7 Women, Signs of Life, Ten Days' Wonder (Chabrol), The Tragedy of a Ridiculous Man, Ulzana's Raid.

No works of 'classical' perfection, romanticism and overreaches only; and no single films from directors (Welles, Buñuel, Hitchcock) whose award must be for Lifetime Achievement.

KEITH CONNOLLY

Australia The Herald
Citizen Kane, La Règle du Jeu, Bicycle Thieves, The Conformist, Winter Light (Bergman), Viridiana, Seven Samurai,

Jules et Jim, 8½, The Godfather I & II. Rationalise though I might, I couldn't in all honesty include an Australian film. Not yet.

PETER COWIE

UK International Film Guide
City Lights, Days and Nights in the Forest, The Godfather, Hiroshima mon Amour, Jules et Jim, Man of Marble, Seven Samurai, The Seventh Seal, Shane, La Strada.

I suspect that Truffaut will march up your charts, Antonioni (and even Godard) will slip down, and Fassbinder will make a mark...

EDGARDO COZARINSKY

France
Six all-time best: Intolerance, Gunnar Hedes Saga (Stillier), Trouble in Paradise, The Fountainhead, all Fritz Lang's work as one multi-episodic serial, La Règle du Jeu, Four post-1975 films about the post-1975 world: Salò, Three Women, Fingers (James Toback), The Third Generation (Fassbinder).

MICHAEL DEMPSEY

USA
Badlands, Barry Lyndon, Charulata, The Eclipse, The End of Summer (Ozu), Jules et Jim, Lawrence of Arabia, The Magnificent Ambersons, Sansho Dayu, Vertigo.

DÁVID DENBY

USA
L'Avventura, Citizen Kane, 8½, The General, The Godfather (Parts I and II), Intolerance, Jules et Jim, La Règle du Jeu, Seven Samurai, The Third Man.

VIRGINIA DIGNAM

UK Morning Star
A Woman of Paris, Z, Les Enfants du Paradis, King Lear (Kozintsev), Tom Jones, The Travelling Players, A Man for All Seasons, Some Like It Hot, Los Olvidados, The Third Man.

WOLF DONNER

West Germany
Andrei Roublev, Citizen Kane, Cries and Whispers, The Discreet Charm of the Bourgeoisie, 8½, The Marriage of Maria Braun, Morocco, Pierrot le Fou, La Terra Trema, A Woman Under the Influence (Cassavetes).

MARIO DORMINSKY

Portugal Cinema Novo
Apocalypse Now, Battleship Potemkin, Bicycle Thieves, The Blue Angel, Citizen Kane, The Elephant Man, Metropo-



lis, La Règle du Jeu, Senso, 2001: A Space Odyssey.

RAYMOND DURGNAT

UK
The Big Night (Losey), Blonde Venus, Chinese Checkers (Stephen Dwoskin), Dom (Borowczyk/Lenica), Fellini-Satyricon, The 5000 Fingers of Dr T (Roy Rowland), Le Mystère Koumiko (Chris Marker), Ruby Gentry, Vampyr, Yellow Submarine.

How painful to pass over true friends like Renoir and Franju, Groucho and Kong, who saw me through from infancy to early middle age. Whatever this list suggests, my soul remains a 30s baby's, born of poetic realism and the magic realms around it—of, let's say, Next of Kin and Les Enfants du Paradis, of Hellzapoppin' and Senza Pieta...

ROGER EBERT

USA Chicago Sun-Times
Bonnie and Clyde, Casablanca, Citizen Kane, La Dolce Vita, Aguirre, Wrath of God, Notorious, Persona, Taxi Driver, The Third Man, 2001: A Space Odyssey.

LOTTE H. EISNER

France
Battleship Potemkin, The Enigma of Kaspar Hauser, La Grande Illusion, Grapes of Wrath, Greed, Kagemusha, M (Lang), The Music Room, The Passion of Joan of Arc, Tabu (Murnau).

ALLEN EYLES

UK Films and Filming
An Autumn Afternoon, L'Avventura, Les Enfants du Paradis, Le Feu Follet, Holiday (Cukor), The Lady with the Little Dog, The Life and Death of Colonel Blimp, The Magnificent Ambersons, The Searchers, Sullivan's Travels.

DAN FAINARU

Israel Jerusalem Post
Citizen Kane, 8½, Ikiru, Monsieur Verdoux, Muriel, W.R.—Mysteries of the Organism (Makavejev), Persona, Pierrot le Fou, La Règle du Jeu, Viridiana.

STEPHEN FARBER

USA
Citizen Kane, 8½, Jules et Jim, Lawrence of Arabia, Lolita, The Music Lovers, Nashville, Notorious, La Règle du Jeu, Sunset Boulevard.

JACQUES FIESCHI

France Cinématographe
Tabu (Murnau), Madame de..., Broken Blossoms, The Devil Is a Woman, The Wedding March, Notorious, The Marriage Circle, The Searchers, The Band Wagon, Le Genou de Claire.

PHILIP FRENCH

UK The Observer
The Lady Vanishes, Bringing Up Baby, La Règle du Jeu, Citizen Kane, Singin' in the Rain, The Quiet Man, Seven Samurai, Ride the High Country, Salvatore Giuliano, California Split.

LUDWIG GESEK

Austria Filmkunst
Citizen Kane, City Lights, Don Quixote (Pabst), Faust (Murnau), Les Jeux Interdits, Maskerade, Menschen am Sonntag, Moulin Rouge, The Third Man, Tree of the Wooden Clogs.

JOHN GILLET

UK
Charulata, Earth, The House on Trubnaya Square (Boris Barnet), Late Spring, The Life and Death of Colonel Blimp, Loyal 47 Ronin of the Genroku Era (Mizoguchi), The Marriage Circle, Our Hospitality, La Règle du Jeu, They Were Expendable.



PENELOPE GILLIATT

UK
The Navigator, The Apu Trilogy, Some Like It Hot, She Wore a Yellow Ribbon, The Discreet Charm of the Bourgeoisie, Citizen Kane, the Wajda Trilogy (A Generation, Kanal, Ashes and Diamonds), Zéro de Conduite, L'Enfant Sauvage, Ikiru, Slave of Love (Nikita, Mikhailov), War and Peace (Bondarchuk), La Règle du Jeu, Alphaville, La Terra Trema.

GIOVANNI GRAZZINI

Italy Corriere della Sera
Andrei Roublev, The Circus, Cries and Whispers, The Discreet Charm of the Bourgeoisie, 8½, Mouchette, The Night of San Lorenzo (The Taviani), Tree of the Wooden Clogs, 2001: A Space Odyssey, Umberto D.

RICHARD GRENIER

USA Commentary
Battleship Potemkin, October, Alexander Nevsky, Citizen Kane, Seven Samurai, Los Olvidados, The Devils (Ken Russell), Fellini's Casanova, Breaker Morant (Beresford), True Confessions (Ulu Grosbard).

JOSÉ LUIS GUARNER

Spain
The Crowd, The General, The Magnificent Ambersons, Monsieur Verdoux, La Prise de Pouvoir par Louis XIV, La Règle du Jeu, The Searchers, Sunrise, Vertigo, Yang Kwei Fei (Mizoguchi).

CHIDANANDA DAS GUPTA

India
Andrei Roublev, Le Crime de M Lange, The Gold Rush, Jules et Jim, Late Autumn, La Notte, The Passion of Joan of Arc, Smiles of a Summer Night, Seven Samurai, The World of Apu.

PER HADDAL

Norway *Aftenposten*
Andrei Roublev, Citizen Kane, Un Condamné à Mort s'est Echappé, Day of Wrath, Modern Times, Les Quatre Cents Coups, The Searchers, The Seventh Seal, Vertigo, Viridiana.

SANDRA HALL

Australia *The Bulletin*
Annie Hall, Autumn Sonata, L'Avventura, Chinatown, Citizen Kane, The Discreet Charm of the Bourgeoisie, Last Tango in Paris, Nashville, Notorious, Singin' in the Rain.

PETER HARCOURT

Canada *The Canadian Forum*
L'Atalante, Deux ou Trois Choses que je Sais d'Elle, Madame de..., Muriel, Nazarin, A Passion (Bergman), La Strada, Sunrise, Le Vieux Pays ou Rimbaud est Mort (Jean Pierre Lefebvre), Yang Kwei Fei (Mizoguchi).

MOLLY HASKELL

USA
Belle de Jour, Madame de..., The Magnificent Ambersons, Ordet (Dreyer), Pierrot le Fou, La Règle du Jeu, The Searchers, Sherlock Jr., Sunrise, Vertigo.

JOHN HINDE

Australia *Week in Film*
Au Hasard, Balthazar, Citizen Kane, Dersu Uzala, The General, High Noon, Hallelujah over George and Bonnie's Pictures, Le Mépris, O Lucky Man, Slave of Love (Mikhailov), Stagecoach, The Third Man.

HANSERIK HJERTÉN

Sweden *Dagens Nyheter*
Andrei Roublev, The Childhood of Maxim Gorki, La Dolce Vita, Earth, The Enigma of Kaspar Hauser, The Gold Rush, Greed, Ikiru, Los Olvidados, The Passion of Joan of Arc.



J. HOBERMAN

USA *The Village Voice*
Au Hasard, Balthazar, Deux ou Trois Choses que je Sais d'Elle, The General, Intolerance, The Man with a Movie Camera, Othello (Welles), Rose Hobart (Joseph Cornell), Scenes from Under Childhood (Brakhage), The Searchers, Ten Minutes to Live (Oscar Micheaux).

RONALD HOLLOWAY

West Germany *Kino*
Citizen Kane, Man of Marble, Andrei Roublev, Ikiru, Nazarin, La Grande Illusion, The Pilgrim, The Passion of Joan of Arc, Intolerance, Man of Aran.

PENELOPE HOUSTON

UK *Sight and Sound*
L'Avventura, The Boat (Keaton), Citizen Kane, Days and Nights in the Forest, Listen to Britain, Ma Nuit chez Maud, Miracle at Morgan's Creek, Muriel, Il Posto, The Third Man.

EBBE IVERSEN

Denmark *Berlingske Tidende*
Aguirre, Wrath of God, Citizen Kane, The Conformist, Jules et Jim, My Darling Clementine, Nashville, The Navi-

gator, The Passenger (Antonioni), Red Beard (Kurosawa), Seven Samurai.

My fellow-countrymen shall probably hang me for high treason for not having included Carl Dreyer, but that's the way it will have to be.

GILLES JACOB

France
The African Queen, America, America, Dr Strangelove, Manhattan, North by Northwest, Orchestra Rehearsal (Fellini), La Règle du Jeu, To Be or Not To Be, Touch of Evil, Zéro de Conduite.

En considérant cette liste, je réalise que les dix films ont un point commun: ils déclenchent chez moi un plaisir du cinéma qui confine à l'extase.

JULIAN JEBB

UK
La Peau Douce, L'Enfant Sauvage, Le Genou de Claire, Les Quatre Cents Coups, Day for Night, 8½, A Night at the Opera, La Baie des Anges, L'Avventura, Persona.

STEVE JENKINS

UK *Monthly Film Bulletin*
Detour (Edgar G. Ulmer), Kiss Me Deadly, A Matter of Life and Death, Mean Streets, Night of the Hunter, Once Upon a Time in the West, The Searchers, There's Always Tomorrow (Sirk), Touch of Evil, Vertigo.

NEIL JILLET/ANTHONY CLARKE

Australia *The Age*
Apocalypse Now, Casablanca, Un Chien Andalou, The Fallen Idol, Ivan the Terrible, Lacombe Lucien, The Letter (Wyler), The Passion of Joan of Arc, Paths of Glory, Les Quatre Cents Coups.

ALBERT JOHNSON

USA
The Best Years of Our Lives, Citizen Kane, City Lights, Earth, Farreback (Rouquier), Henry V, The Last Laugh, Nights of Cabiria, War and Peace (Bondarchuk), The World of Apu.

STANLEY KAUFFMANN

USA *The New Republic*
L'Avventura, Battleship Potemkin, The General, The Gold Rush, La Grande Illusion, The Marquise of O..., The Passion of Joan of Arc, Persona, Seven Samurai, Tokyo Story.

NICOLAS KENT

UK *Stillis*
Aguirre, Wrath of God, Chimes at Midnight, Les Enfants du Paradis, The



Godfather, Nashville, The Passenger, Seven Samurai, Solaris, 2001: A Space Odyssey, The Wild Bunch.

TULLIO KEZICH

Italy *La Repubblica*
The Crowd, M (Lang), Man of Aran, Modern Times, La Grande Illusion, Alexander Nevsky, Stagecoach, Paisa, Sunset Boulevard, La Dolce Vita. Chronological order.

ARTHUR KNIGHT

USA
All That Jazz, L'Avventura, Bicycle Thieves, Citizen Kane, Day for Night, Dr Strangelove, E.T.: The Extra-terrestrial, Rashomon, Sherlock Jr., Singin' in the Rain.

I expect that this is a rather conservative list, but it represents not only 'desert island' movies, but also those that I still find useful for teaching—pictures that still make strong contact with today's student film-makers.

MARI KUTNÁ

UK *The Lady*
Napoleon, The Travelling Players/The

Huntsmen, Some Like It Hot, Nashville, Confrontation, Man of Marble, Strike, Blowout (Ferreri), Days and Nights in the Forest, A New Leaf (Elaine May).

JOHN FRANCIS LANE

UK/Italy
Accattone, L'Avventura, Citizen Kane, La Dolce Vita, Les Enfants du Paradis, Henry V, Orphée, Some Like It Hot, La Terra Trema, 2001: A Space Odyssey.

Taking literally the concept of 'Desert Island Films' and so excluding the works of directors whose films should at this point be included en bloc among the best of all time, such as Eisenstein, Chaplin, Buñuel, Bergman, Renoir, etc.

JAMES LEAHY

UK
The Battle of Chile Parts 1 and 2 (Patricio Guzman), Bitter Victory, Cedo (Sembene), Hanoi, Tuesday 13th (Santiago Alvarez), Masculin-Féminin, The Only Son (Ozu), Une Partie de Campagne/The Golden Coach (Renoir double bill), The Searchers, Singin' in the Rain, Vampyr.

JAY LEYDA

USA
The Mother and the Law, Nanook of the North, A Woman of Paris, Greed, The General, October, The Passion of Joan of Arc, Arsenal, Un Chien Andalou, Zéro de Conduite, La Règle du Jeu, Citizen Kane, The Treasure of the Sierra Madre, Seven Samurai, Wild Strawberries.

TODD MCCARTHY

USA *Variety*
Chimes at Midnight, Le Crime de M Lange, Les Deux Anglaises et le Continent, The Devil Is a Woman, Les Enfants du Paradis, Heaven Can Wait, Lawrence of Arabia, Le Mépris, The Navigator, To Have and Have Not.

AITO MÄKINEN

Finland
L'Age d'Or, Battleship Potemkin, Britannia Hospital, Empire of the Senses, L'Innocente (Visconti), Journal d'un Curé de Campagne, Modern Times, Une Partie de Campagne, Seven Samurai (complete version), Star Wars.

If one wants to find any line in my list, it might be called Rebellion...

DEREK MALCOLM

UK *The Guardian*
An Autumn Afternoon, Barren Lives (Dos Santos), Charulata, El, The



Enigma of Kaspar Hauser, Madame de..., Rio Bravo, Touch of Evil, Ugetsu Monogatari, Wild Strawberries.

POUL MALMKJÆR

Denmark *Kosmorama*
Cabaret, Citizen Kane, The Crowd, The Fatal Glass of Beer (Bruckman/W.C. Fields), Greed, The Leopard, La Règle du Jeu, Seven Samurai, Singin' in the Rain, Vampyr.

ROGER MANVELL

UK
Belle de Jour, Citizen Kane, 8½, The General, The Gold Rush, Hiroshima mon Amour, Intolerance, October, Persona, Seven Samurai (full version).

LOUIS MARCORELLES

France *Le Monde*
The Awful Truth, Three Comrades, Mr Smith Goes to Washington, Primary (Leacock and Drew), La Région Centrale (Michael Snow), Amor de Perdicao (Manoel de Oliveira), The Age of Earth (Glauber Rocha), Martinovits (Judith Elek), La Bête Lumineuse (Pierre Perrault), Britannia Hospital. Chronological order.

GAVIN MILLAR

UK *The Listener*
Bringing Up Baby, Citizen Kane, Dersu Uzala, The General, It's a Gift, Orchestra Rehearsal, Il Posto, La Règle du Jeu, Singin' in the Rain, Tirez sur le Pianiste.

I dare say everyone says the same, but there could be a different, equally heartfelt ten tomorrow.

TOM MILNE

UK
La Chienne, I Walked with a Zombie (Tourneur), Kiss Me Deadly, The Magnificent Ambersons, Moonrise, My Darling Clementine, The Night of the Hunter, True Heart Susie, Les Vampires, Les Yeux sans Visage.

JAMES MONACO

USA
The Big Sleep, Citizen Kane, Deux ou Trois Choses que je Sais d'Elle, 8½, The Godfather, It's a Wonderful Life, Modern Times, North by Northwest, Singin' in the Rain, 2001: A Space Odyssey.

GENE MOSKOWITZ

USA/France *Variety*
El Greco, The Life of Oharu, Limelight, M (Lang), The Quiet Man, La Règle du Jeu, The World of Apu, Zéro de Conduite.

GÜNTER NETZEBAND

East Germany *Film und Fernsehen*
Battleship Potemkin, Citizen Kane, Earth, The Gold Rush, Ich war 19 (Konrad Wolf), Ivan's Childhood, Modern Times, 1900, Ordinary Fascism (Romm), Rashomon.

GEOFFREY NOWELL-SMITH

UK
One Week (Keaton), A Propos de Nice, Une Partie de Campagne, Listen to Britain, A Valparaiso (Ivens), Toute la Mémoire du Monde, La Jetée, The Bridegroom, the Comedienne and the Pimp (Straub), Breakfast (Snow), Amy! (Mulvey/Wollen).

EDMOND ORTS

Spain *Dirigido por...*
All About Eve, Amarcord, Chimes at Midnight, Citizen Kane, The Leopard, The Man Who Shot Liberty Valance, The Misfits, North by Northwest, Providence, Singin' in the Rain.

DAVID OVERBEY

USA/France
L'Avventura, Le Ciel est à Vous (Grémillon), Gilda, Im Lauf der Zeit (Wenders).

Left to right: 'The Seven Samurai', 'The Lady with the Little Dog', 'The Discreet Charm of the Bourgeoisie', 'Pierrot le Fou', 'La Jetée', 'A New Leaf'.

Over the page: 'Les Dames du Bois de Boulogne', 'Madame de...', 'Playtime', 'Our Hospitality'.



Lady from Shanghai, Letter from an Unknown Woman, Der müde Tod, Ossessione, Steamboat Bill Jr., Stromboli.

ENNO PATALAS

West Germany
From the Clouds to the Resistance (Straub/Huillet), Germany Year Zero (with original soundtrack), The Life of Oharu, Lola Montès, Nosferatu (Murnau), La Région Centrale, The Saga of Anatahan, Sauve Qui Peut (La Vie), Which Way to the Front (Jerry Lewis), While the City Sleeps.

BEATRIZ PACHECO PEREIRA

Portugal *Cinema Novo*
Apocalypse Now, Battleship Potemkin, Citizen Kane, The Elephant Man, Ivan the Terrible, Johnny Got His Gun (Dalton Trumbo), Kagemusha, M (Lang), Providence, Ugetsu Monogatari.

MICHEL PÉREZ

France *Le Matin*
L'Age d'Or, The General, King Kong, The Magnificent Ambersons, La Règle du Jeu, The Scarlet Empress, Schatten (Robison), Sunrise, Ugetsu Monogatari.

Under Capricorn, and all the Busby Berkeley numbers produced for Warner Brothers.

CHRIS PETIT

UK
Les Dames du Bois de Boulogne, Le Deuxième Souffle (Melville), The Goalkeeper's Fear of the Penalty, I Know Where I'm Going, The Man with the X-Ray Eyes (Corman), Out of the Past (Tourneur), Passion (Godard), Ride Lonesome (Boetticher), Spione, Voyage in Italy.

HANS GÜNTHER PFLAUM

West Germany *Süddeutsche Zeitung*
Un Condamné à Mort s'est Echappé, Francesco, Guiliare di Dio (Rossellini), Une Partie de Campagne, Pierrot le Fou, La Illusion Viaja en Tranvia (Buñuel), Nosferatu (Murnau), Stagecoach, Red River, Stalker, The Third Generation (Fassbinder: future decades will justify that choice!).

DAVID PIRIE

UK *Time Out*
American Graffiti, Chinatown, Close Encounters of the Third Kind, La Collectionneuse, The Devil Rides Out (Fisher), Illustrious Corpses, Invasion of the Body Snatchers, Pierrot le Fou, Splendour in the Grass, Vertigo.

The more films I see the more I marvel at how good a medium cinema is at conveying emotion and how comparatively poor it is at conveying intellectual ideas. Sam Fuller's dictum that the cinema is 'in a word ... emotion' from Pierrot seems to me almost exactly right.

DILYS POWELL

UK *Sunday Times, Punch*
Anna Karenina (Brown), Citizen Kane, City Lights, The General, The Grapes of Wrath, The Lady with the Little Dog, Le Million, On the Town, Rear Window, Umberto D.

Just ten out of the scores I should like to see again. Do I want to see Potemkin again? Frankly no; but I do want a Garbo, even if it isn't a masterpiece.

DEREK PROUSE

UK
L'Atalante, Citizen Kane, El, Manhattan, Mutter Krausen's Fahrt ins Glück (Piel Jutz), October, Orphée, Ossessione, The Palm Beach Story, Three Brothers.



TIM PULLEINE

UK
L'Atalante, Barry Lyndon, Blow Up, Citizen Kane, Fires Were Started, It Happened One Night, Le Mépris, Naked City, North by Northwest, The Third Man.

JOHN PYM

UK *Sight and Sound*
A Bout de Souffle, Chimes at Midnight, Fat City, I Was Born But... (Ozu), Limelight, Manhattan, The Music Room, My Childhood Trilogy (Bill Douglas), The Palm Beach Story, Une Partie de Campagne.

MILAN RANKOVIC

Yugoslavia
Amarcord, Andrei Roublev, Ashes and Diamonds, Battleship Potemkin, Citizen Kane, 1900, The Passion of Joan of Arc, Rashomon, The Virgin Spring, Viridiana.

DON RANVAUD

UK *Framework*
La Hora de los Hornos (Solanas), L'Hypothèse du Tableau Volé (Ruiz), Invisible Adversaries (Valie Export), La Luna, The Man with a Movie

Camera, Rear Window, Salò, We Can't Go Home Again (Nicholas Ray), West Indies (Abid Med Hondo), Zorns Lemma (Frampton).

TONY RAYNS

UK
A Farewell to Arms (Borzage), Die Geburt der Nation (Klaus Wyborny), The House on Trubnaya Square, A Matter of Life and Death, Night and Fog in Japan (Oshima), Pierrot le Fou, The Scarlet Empress, Street Angel (Yuan Muzhi), Tale of the Late Chrysanthemums (Mizoguchi), Touch of Evil.

JOÃO CARLOS RODRIGUES

Brazil *Filme Cultura*
Greed, Vampyr, Voyage in Italy, The Eclipse, The Music Room, Scorpio Rising (Kenneth Anger), Terra em Transe (Rocha), Weekend, Shadow of Our Forgotten Ancestors (Paradjanov), An Actor's Revenge (Ichikawa). Chronological order.

JONATHAN ROSENBAUM

USA
Playtime, Gertrud, A Bout de Souffle, The Eclipse, Tale of the Late Chrysanthemums, City Lights, Céline et Julie vont en Bateau, La Nuit du Carrefour, Providence, Too Early, Too Late (Straub-Huillet).

PAUL ROTH

UK
Battleship Potemkin, Earth, Greed, Intolerance, Kameradschaft, Moana, The Last Laugh, Los Olvidados, Song of Ceylon, Umberto D.

E. RUBINSTEIN

USA
Belle de Jour, City Lights, How Green Was My Valley, Journal d'un Curé de Campagne, Madame de..., The Magnificent Ambersons, Notorious, La Règle du Jeu, Steamboat Bill, Jr., Vivre sa Vie.

For the absence of oriental films, I will (somewhat disingenuously) plead ignorance and a certain hesitation in the face of very alien cultural assumptions. For the absence of Murnau and Lang, Sternberg and Hawks, Truffaut and Resnais, I have no explanation whatever.

ANDREW SARRIS

USA *The Village Voice*
The Great Dictator, The Flowers of St Francis (Rossellini), Madame de...,



Le Mépris, La Règle du Jeu, The Searchers, Steamboat Bill, Jr., Tristana, Ugetsu Monogatari, Vertigo.

TADAO SATO

Japan *The Asahi Newspaper*
A Woman of Paris, Maskerade (Willi Forst), Une Partie de Campagne, Brief Encounter, Germany, Year Zero, My Life (Shi Hui), Tokyo Story, Pather Panchali, Ordet (Dreyer), Antonio das Mortes. Chronological order.

RICHARD SCHICKEL

USA *Time*
Casablanca, Citizen Kane, Dr Strangelove, It's a Gift (W. C. Fields), Manhattan, Red River, Singin' in the Rain, Sullivan's Travels, Trouble in Paradise, Vertigo.

The criterion in my case was never 'relevance', only delight...

YUKICHI SHINADA

Japan
A Bout de Souffle, Bonnie and Clyde, Citizen Kane, The Conformist, La Dolce Vita, The Drunken Angel (Kurosawa), Manhattan, Nashville, Pather Panchali, Tokyo Story.

YOSHIO SHIRAI

Japan
La Dolce Vita, Hiroshima mon Amour, The Life of Oharu, Ludwig (Visconti), Outcast of the Islands, Der Rest ist Schweigen (Kautner), Salvatore Giuliano, Die Stünderin (Willi Forst), Teorema, Tokyo Story.

SUSAN SONTAG

USA
Deux ou Trois Choses que je Sais d'Elle, Europa 51, High and Low (Kurosawa), Hitler, a Film from Germany, Le Mépris, Napoleon, La Règle du Jeu, Storm Over Asia, Tokyo Story, 2001: A Space Odyssey.

ELISABETH SÖRENSEN

Sweden *Svenska Dagbladet*
Christ Stopped at Eboli, Cries and Whispers, Fellini Roma, Une Giornata Particolare (Scola), The Marriage of Maria Braun, Miracolo a Milano, Missing, Molière (Ariane Mnouchkine), 1900, Tree of the Wooden Clogs.

MICHAEL SRAGOW

USA *Rolling Stone*
The Wild Bunch, Les Enfants du Paradis, The Godfather (Parts I and II), Citizen Kane, E.T.: The Extra-terrestrial, My Darling Clementine, The Treasure of the Sierra Madre, A Hard Day's Night, The Great Escape, Yankee Doodle Dandy (Curtiz).

ELLIOTT STEIN

USA
Ajantrik (Ghatak), An Actor's Revenge, The Bat Whispers (Roland West), Chandralekha (S. S. Vasan), Gertrud, Gunnar Hedes Saga, King Kong, The Lullaby of Broadway' number in Gold Diggers of 1935 (Busby Berkeley), The Magnificent Ambersons, Why Not? (Shohei Imamura).

DAVID STRATTON

Australia
Greed, The General, La Grande Illusion, Citizen Kane, The Grapes of Wrath, Ikiru, Singin' in the Rain, North by Northwest, Dr Strangelove, Une Femme Mariée.

PHILIP STRICK

UK
Autumn Sonata, L'Avventura, E.T.: The Extra-terrestrial, French Cancan, Marnie, Meet Me in St Louis, Le Mépris, The Searchers, Solaris, 2001: A Space Odyssey.



ELIZABETH SUSSEX

UK
L'Age d'Or, Cries and Whispers, The Man with the Movie Camera, Mouchette, My Homeland (Vas), Nuit et Brouillard, Orphée, Pather Panchali, Stalker, Tokyo Story.

ALBERTO TABBLA

Argentina
Angel (Lubitsch), Badlands, Barry Lyndon, Citizen Kane, The Crowd, Dishonoured, Midnight (Leisen), Our Hospitality, La Règle du Jeu, Tokyo Story.

JOHN RUSSELL TAYLOR

UK
Cet Obscur Objet du Désir, Funny Face, The Great Waltz (Duvivier, Sternberg et al), Ivan the Terrible, Kind Hearts and Coronets, The Magnificent Ambersons, Marnie, The Old Dark House, Singin' in the Rain, The Thief of Baghdad.

PAUL TAYLOR

UK *Time Out*
Chimes at Midnight, Gun Crazy (Lewis), Kings of the Road, A Matter of Life and Death, Once Upon a Time

in the West, Out One: Spectre, Pat Garrett and Billy the Kid, Performance (Cammell/Roeg), Pickpocket, Le Samourai (Melville).

Each title arbitrarily heading an associated list of ten—at least. Fog Line (Larry Gottheim) or Straight and Narrow (Tony and Beverly Conrad) would be the shorts to put me in the mood for any of the above.

MAX TESSIER

France
Andrei Roublev, The Ceremony (Oshima), 8½, Greed, Ikiru, The Life of Oharu, The Music Room, Point Blank, Touch of Evil, The Travelling Players.

DAVID THOMSON

UK/USA
Celine et Julie vont en Bateau, Citizen Kane, The Discreet Charm of the Bourgeoisie, Lola Montès, The Night of the Hunter, The Passenger, The River, Shanghai Express, To Have and Have Not, Ugetsu Monogatari, and as a necessary cheat, Bringing up Baby (for Cary Grant).

MARKKU TUULI

Finland
Aguirre, Wrath of God, Camouflage (Zanussi), City Girl (Murnau), Fireman's Street 25 (Szabo), The Godfather, I Was Born But..., Love Me Tonight, Mahanagar, Our Hospitality, The Searchers.

ALEXANDER WALKER

UK *The Standard*
Camille, A Clockwork Orange, Les Dames du Bois de Boulogne, Death in Venice, Dr Strangelove, Killer's Kiss, Last Tango in Paris, Mephisto, Richard III, Triumph of the Will.

DAVID WILSON

UK
L'Avventura, The Burmese Harp, Citizen Kane, Letter from an Unknown Woman, The Navigator, The Night of the Hunter, Persona, Red River, La Règle du Jeu, The Travelling Players. Some reminders that the cinema can surprise and astonish, at a time when surprises are few and astonishment belongs to the past.

ROBIN WOOD

UK
Celine et Julie vont en Bateau, Chikamatsu Monogatari, Days of Heaven, Europa 51, Letter from an Unknown Woman, Rio Bravo, La Règle du Jeu, Tokyo Story, Tout Va Bien, Vertigo.



BASIL WRIGHT

UK
The Apu Trilogy, Earth, The Gold Rush, La Grande Illusion, Hiroshima mon Amour, Ivan the Terrible, Le Journal d'un Curé de Campagne, Los Olvidados, Sciuscia, Ugetsu Monogatari.

FRANCIS WYNDHAM

UK
Build My Gallows High (Tourneur), Citizen Kane, Imitation of Life (Sirk), L'Innocent, Mirror, Monsieur Verdoux, Napoleon, La Règle du Jeu, A Star Is Born (Cukor), The Third Man.

KOICHI YAMADA

Japan *The Asahi Newspaper*
8½, El, The Fate of Lee Khan (King Hu), Hangmen Also Die, Hattori, The Man Who Disappeared Yesterday (Masahiro Makino), North by Northwest, La Règle du Jeu, Sherlock Jr., To Be or Not to Be.

HELENA YLÄNEN

Finland *Helsingin Sanomat*
L'Innocent, The Passenger, Peeping Tom, Rebel Without a Cause, Toni, Touch of Evil, Vertigo, Wagonmaster, Wild Strawberries, The World of Apu.